



Robert C. May
Telephone: (510) 987-0711
Email: robert.may@ucop.edu

*Chair of the Assembly of the Academic Senate
Faculty Representative to the Regents
University of California
1111 Franklin Street, 12th Floor
Oakland, California 94607-5200*

July 8, 2019

**JANET NAPOLITANO, PRESIDENT
UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA**

RE: Canary Mission

Dear Janet,

At its June 26 meeting, the Academic Council discussed and endorsed the attached letter from the University Committee on Academic Freedom (UCAF) about the “Canary Mission,” an organization that publishes the names of academics and other individuals it deems to be anti-Semitic, anti-Israel, or pro-Palestinian. Council shares UCAF’s concerns about the potential negative effects of this group and its activities on UC faculty and students as well as in creating a potential chilling effect on our campuses.

We would also like to suggest that the University make available assistance, including legal assistance, to members of the University community who are listed on Canary Mission, and who wish to have their names removed.

Attached you will also find a statement endorsed by the Santa Cruz division of the Academic Senate, which echoes and elaborates on issues addressed in the UCAF letter.

Please do not hesitate to contact me if you have additional questions.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in brown ink that reads "Rob C May".

Robert C. May, Chair
Academic Council

Encl:

cc: Provost Brown
UCAF Chair Rauchway
Academic Council
Senate Directors



UNIVERSITY COMMITTEE ON ACADEMIC FREEDOM (UCAF)
Eric Rauchway, Chair
earauchway@ucdavis.edu

Assembly of the Academic Senate
1111 Franklin Street, 12th Floor
Oakland, CA 94607-5200
Phone: (510) 987-9466
Fax: (510) 763-0309

March 29, 2019

**ROBERT MAY, CHAIR
ACADEMIC SENATE**

RE: CANARY MISSION

Dear Robert,

In our meeting of March 21, members of the University Committee on Academic Freedom resolved to urge Academic Council to take notice of the activities of Canary Mission, an organization devoted, in its own words, to identifying "people and groups that promote hatred of the USA, Israel and Jews on North American college campuses," principally by creating a searchable online database (canarymission.org) accessible to the public. To the extent that any institution uses Canary Mission's characterizations to evaluate academics or discipline students, it would constitute a threat to academic freedom.

Canary Mission's definition of "hatred of the USA, Israel and Jews" appears to include not only support of the Boycott, Divestment, and Sanctions (BDS) movement, but also failure to advocate its suppression. By contrast, the American Association of University Professors opposes any academic boycott but also opposes interference with the scholarly activity of BDS supporters.¹ UCAF has not taken a position for or against the BDS movement. We do hold the view that support or opposition to BDS must not affect evaluation of academic work by faculty or students. The AAUP's stance is consistent with UCAF's position; the work of Canary Mission is not.

Canary Mission's website features the slogan "because the world should know." Its own staff and funding are not listed. Its methods reportedly include contacting employers of people on its list, as well as tagging them on social media, and using search engine optimization so that its entries appear early on internet searches. The objective appears to be to influence admissions, hiring, promotion, grant applications, and other decisions affecting the lives and careers of people listed on its site.

In 2016, the chair of AAUP's Committee A on Academic Freedom and Tenure, Hank Reichman, wrote that "Canary Mission is a blacklist, pure and simple. It echoes the long-discredited and horrific blacklists of the

¹ AAUP Statement On Anti-BDS Legislation and Universities, 8/8/18 <<https://www.aaup.org/news/statement-anti-bds-legislation-and-universities#.XJqk8qeZPUI>>.

McCarthy era."² Reichman wrote to support the petition of faculty who serve, or might serve, on graduate admissions committees, who concluded that "the Canary Mission website should not be trusted as a resource to evaluate students' qualifications for admission."³

UCAF members hold that the University should take a similar position with respect to the evaluation not only of prospective and current students, but academics. UCAF members believe, in keeping with APM - 010, that "Academic freedom requires that teaching and scholarship be assessed by reference to the professional standards that sustain the University's pursuit and achievement of knowledge. The substance and nature of those standards properly lie within the expertise and authority of the faculty as a body." Those standards have led to the appointment and advancement of UC academics who appear on the Canary Mission site. Those standards, alone, should continue to inform the University's evaluation of scholarly work. Canary Mission's reports do not meet those standards.

Sincerely,



Eric Rauchway, Chair
UCAF

² Hank Reichman, "Another Blacklist Emerges," Academe Blog 8/1/16 < <https://academeblog.org/2016/08/01/another-blacklist-emerges/>>.

³ "University Faculty Condemn Canary Mission Blacklist."
<https://docs.google.com/forms/d/e/1FAIpQLSc_SsqroBqmKANYy1KsHobZ3DTdI9j4HjLNOOnK3PDx9TNzMXA/viewform>.

UCSC Canary Mission Resolution

Divisional Senate Meeting • May 17, 2019

Overview

Canary Mission (canarymission.org) is an anonymously hosted website that, in its own words, is devoted to identifying "people and groups that promote hatred of the USA, Israel and Jews on North American college campuses," principally by creating a searchable online database accessible to the public. Canary Mission's website features the slogan "because the world should know." Its own staff and funding are not listed. Its methods reportedly include contacting employers of people on its list, as well as tagging them on social media, and using search engine optimization so that its entries appear early on internet searches. The objective appears to be to adversely influence admissions, hiring, promotion, grant applications, and other decisions affecting the lives and careers of people listed on its site. Such an objective would be problematic under any circumstances, but it is compounded by the inclusion of numerous errors, falsehoods, and misleading statements in the entries on individual people.

Canary Mission's definition of "hatred of the USA, Israel and Jews" is also very broad. As a memo from UCAF to Academic Council notes, "it appears to include not only support of the Boycott, Divestment, and Sanctions (BDS) movement, but also failure to advocate its suppression." UCAF has not taken a position for or against the BDS movement, instead holding the view that support or opposition to BDS must not affect evaluation of academic work by faculty or students.

Canary Mission has already been discussed in the systemwide Senate in UCAF. A letter on the subject has been sent to Academic Council, which will be addressing the topic in detail at an upcoming meeting. Our role here is to take the temperature of our campus on the subject, and to determine our campus appetite for action in the form of the resolution included in the CALL. The resolution includes an instruction to UCSC Senate Chair Lau to take our resolution to the Academic Council, and specifically to advocate for a "joint Administration-Senate statement" condemning the purpose and method of Canary Mission.

Canary Mission at UCSC

A number of UCSC faculty and students are listed on the Canary Mission website. We are concerned about the effect on members of our community, whose futures rest on their reputations, which are under assault. We are also concerned with Canary Mission's anonymous accusations, which contribute to an atmosphere of suppression and run counter to our principles of academic freedom, our right to freedom of expression, and the UC Santa Cruz Principles of Community.

Canary Mission was brought to CAF's attention this Fall by faculty members who are listed on the site and who also knew that being listed was having negative material consequences for at least one student who is on the site. Throughout the academic year, CAF has had conversations about this issue with Chancellor Blumenthal, Campus Counsel, and several other members of campus administration and staff, as well as with CAAD, whose purview overlaps

with those of CAF on this case. These have been extremely productive and everyone involved has expressed an interest in figuring out how to best address this troubling issue.

Neither UCSC CAF nor CAAD has a position for or against BDS. Instead, we see our joint role as keeping the space open for debate of these issues, and ensuring the support and protection of members of our community. Thus our resolution, whose functions are to reject the purpose and method of a website intent on blacklisting and harming members of our community, and, to the extent possible, to support those in our community who have been harmed. We want to be quite clear: the resolution is not a referendum on BDS.

Resolution

The proposed resolution is therefore intended to establish institutional commitment to ameliorating and limiting the harms being done to faculty and students who are listed on the Canary Mission site, to clearly lay out and describe the actions that we believe can and should be taken at this time, to make a public and official statement on this topic as a faculty body, and to encourage such statements from other university entities and actors.

The resolution, which was included in the agenda call, states:

The UC Santa Cruz Division of the Academic Senate calls on Chancellor Blumenthal to initiate the following actions:

1. Formally affirm that Canary Mission and similar websites will not be used in any university procedures, including hiring, reviewing, grant-making, admissions, or any other selection procedures;
2. Issue a statement disavowing the activities of Canary Mission and similar websites in attacking academic freedom, seeking to stifle freedom of discussion, and--by virtue of its "easily searchable format"-- inviting attack on faculty, students, and other members of the university community;
3. Offer free legal assistance to any UC Santa Cruz affiliate who is listed on the Canary Mission website and who is being harmed by being so listed. Such assistance may include help with removal from the website, help in obtaining visas and other travel documentation for faculty and students whose research abroad (e.g., in Israel/Palestine) has been compromised, a university letter for the placement files of affected students condemning Canary Mission and affirming the students' good standing at UC Santa Cruz, or other help required by those facing material consequences of their listing on the site;
4. Offer free psychological assistance to any UC Santa Cruz affiliate who is listed on the Canary Mission web site and who is being harmed by being so listed.

5. Provide free technical assistance to remove profiles from the site, if possible; and
6. Seek a statement from UC Office of the President and the Council of Chancellors condemning Canary Mission. We urge consideration of a joint Administration-Senate statement on this topic. To that end, we also ask that Chair Lau take this resolution to Academic Council for system-wide consideration.