UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA   **ACADEMIC SENATE**

UNIVERSITY COMMITTEE ON AFFIRMATIVE ACTION, DIVERSITY, AND EQUITY
January 18, 2018

Meeting Minutes

1. **Agenda review, approval of meeting minutes from October**
   Tanya Golash-Boza, UCAADE Chair

Chair Tanya Golash-Boza began the meeting with some relevant systemwide updates. Academic Council Chair Shane White feels that the time is right to pursue increases in faculty salaries and close the faculty salary gap. UC's faculty salaries currently lag an estimated eight percent behind the traditional comparator institutions (the "comp 8": Harvard, MIT, Stanford, SUNY-Buffalo, University of Illinois – Urbana-Champaign, University of Michigan – Ann Arbor, University of Virginia, Yale University). Chair Golash-Boza is participating in a UCFW subgroup that drafted an action plan sent to President Napolitano, and is trying to bring considerations for equity into the recommendations.

A report on the results of the use of one-time funding to support equal opportunity in faculty employment was included in the meeting background. The University used the $2 million allocated last year by the state legislature to identify best practices for recruitment of a diverse faculty by concentrating funds on a few targeted interventions. Of the three proposals selected, two demonstrated advances in diversity when compared to similar units. Campuses developed distinct recruitment programs that included efforts such as greater outreach, enhanced use of PPFP, and targeting faculty in the post-doc stage of their careers. The proposals had strong leadership from deans and other leaders. The successful searches used rubrics for decision making, contributions to diversity statements, and partner opportunity. Funding was provided again this year, and a similar structure was used for the selection of proposals from four campuses.

2. **Member reports**
   a. Round-robin on campus issues

Davis: With a new Chancellor in 2017, UC Davis is a campus in transition. Diversity was already on the radar as a key campus issue before the new Chancellor's hiring, so the campus is hopeful. UC Davis is piloting a "step-plus system" and will be hiring 17 African American faculty. UC Davis is planning on becoming a Hispanic-serving institution (HSI), and so will likely also be hiring Latino faculty.

Irvine: The UC Irvine campus continues to grow, but is now talking about plateau issues. Some recent issues include the launch of the new diversity initiative and new lines for diversity hires. The leadership has been committed to diversity.

UCLA: UCLA's local committee is currently working on program reviews and recently met with an Associate Vice Chancellor to discuss faculty development programs, including a mentoring program that matches junior faculty with senior faculty members and an academic personnel review workshop that offers fellowships to underrepresented minority faculty. UCLA participates in the National Center for Faculty Development and Diversity.

Merced: UC Merced's Committee on Diversity & Equity is meeting with the committee on Faculty Welfare & Academic Freedom to discuss diversity and faculty hiring. They are interested in creating and supporting target of opportunity hires, increased monitoring of the search process, and written guidance for

diversity and equity. The committee is working with CAP and the Vice Provost for Faculty on guidelines for how contribution to diversity statements should be credited in tenure and promotion. The committee is also reviewing Merced's FEA program. UC Merced's administration is investigating how to assess individual faculty retention efforts and implementation of a "step-plus" program for incremental promotions.

Riverside: UC Riverside does not have a faculty equity advisor program, but the local committee is investigating the options and there is a currently a pilot in three schools. There has been some initial resistance to having FEAs involved with salary equity and hiring. A large number faculty from underrepresented groups left the campus in the past year. The Senate committee asked the administration for exit survey data on the exodus, but the administration has not provided it due to concerns about anonymity and confidentiality. There has been some turnover in leadership with the appointment of a new Provost. The local committee has been involved in issues of sustainability, for which there are aspects of equity and equal opportunity as well.

UCSD: UCSD does not have a campus-wide requirement for a statement on contribution to diversity during the hiring process, but statements have been required in individual departments such as Engineering and Physical Sciences. The local committee is planning to make a recommendation that statements be required in all areas of faculty hiring. San Diego's Office of Diversity Equity & Inclusion is evaluating contribution to diversity statements in order to make recommendations for improvements and to provide rubrics for search committees. Faculty Equity Advisors on the campus provide training for search committees, which is required (same at Irvine and UCSC). The campus experimented with an additional layer of diversity statement review for searches, with promising results.

UCSF: UCSF is continuing to deal with space allocation issues, and there are diversity, equity, retention issues around workspace. The EQOP is monitoring a Faculty Equity Advisor pilot program and discussing how to spend Chancellor's Fund money. UCSF participates in the National Center for Faculty Development & Diversity.

UCSB: UCSB's Committee on Diversity & Equity is grappling with recommending or requiring implicit bias training for all search committee members – or for everyone on campus. They are reviewing data on current practices. The committee is also developing guidelines and timeframe for a new faculty diversity award.

UCSC: UCSC's local committee is involved with programming for the Martin Luther King Jr. Memorial Convocation, including scheduling reading groups around campus. The committee is working on finalizing diversity statement guidelines and collaborating with other faculty committees on issues around student evaluations of teaching. They are looking into graduate development and how to "mentor the mentors," and discussing the creation of a forum for evaluations, micro-aggressions, and more. The campus is trying to set up a Chancellor's Postdoctoral program.

Student representatives: The annual Students of Color conference takes place next weekend at UC Riverside. The event, hosted by the UC Student Association, attracts graduate students and undergraduates from around the system, and includes workshops and networking.

Some campuses have reported that people with white nationalist agendas are posing as students to infiltrate classrooms. This can feel threatening to both students and faculty.

b. Update on UCFW ad hoc task force to review and recommend changes to UC's "Gold Book" - the police procedures manual

Mona Lynch is UCAADE's representative to the systemwide group formed to address issues around policing and the differences in campus policing practices. The task force is looking at reforms and revisions to the police handbook. Use of force is a critical issue, but there are others such as campus climate. Most campuses – but not all – have Police Advisory Boards, but there is no systemwide police oversight board. The task force will have another meeting to prepare recommendations, then a final meeting to wrap up and consider policy on a larger scale.

Student representative Davon Thomas will ask the UC Students Association if they have input, and will report to Mona Lynch.

3. **Systemwide Review Items**
- [Proposed Revised APM Sections 285, 210-3, 133, 740, 135, 235 - Second Round](#) (pdf) (Comments due February 21, 2018)

The second round review of changes to APM sections regarding the Lecturer with Security of Employment title series was discussed. The second round incorporates comments provided by the Academic Council to Academic Personnel administrators, such as the ability of a campus or school to choose a working title such as "Teaching Professor" or equivalent. The expectations for scholarly activity were changed to "Professional and/or Scholarly Achievement and Activity." The policy allows for a cap on the number of "Security of Employment" positions at each campus. Chair Golash-Boza opined that since it will not be possible for every class to be taught by ladder-rank faculty, it is better to have lecturers with "Security of Employment" than to expand the pool of "contingent" (Unit 18) lecturers who earn lower salaries and have fewer benefits along with lower expectations. Golash-Boza suggested that committee members think about the changes to the title series as a larger equity issue.

Committee members discussed whether the proposed changes to the series change the criteria and expectations for faculty in those positions. At least at some campuses, LSOEs were not included in any preliminary discussions about the changes. Concerns included equity, standards for evaluation, and workload.

The committee will respond with comments.

Action: Chair Golash-Boza will draft a response to send to committee members for comment via email.

- [Proposed Presidential Policy on Open Access for Theses and Dissertations](#) (pdf) (Comments due March 14, 2018)

UCAADE will not opine.

- [Proposed Amendment to Senate Bylaw 128, Conflicts of Interest](#) (pdf) (Comments due March 14, 2018)

UCAADE endorses the statement.

4. **Consultation with Academic Senate Leadership**
   Shane White, Academic Council Chair

In the aftermath of the State's audit of UCOP, the Academic Council made three requests of President Napolitano: (1) the appoint of a senior advisor with deep campus operational experience in teaching, research, and policy, who is not otherwise involved in the administration or conduct of the university; (2) elevation of the role of the Provost to a level consistent with that office's historic level of responsibility, and inclusion of the Provost in all key discussions; and (3) ensuring early involvement of the Senate in any initiatives or crisis response by including a Senate leader in the President's "cabinet" or major planning meetings. The President recently appointed Dan Hare, former Academic Council Chair, as the senior advisor. She added the Provost to the leadership group, and Senate leadership to her Presidential Advisory Group.

UCOP contracted the Huron consulting firm after the State's audit to review the operations of the Office of the President. The Huron Report is currently being previewed by senior management, and will be released publicly in the near future.

In the recently released Governor's Budget, UC received a net increase of 2.7 percent of base budget rather than the 4 percent negotiated previously. $50 million is also still being withheld pending UC's fulfillment of specific requests from the State.

Chair White emphasized the need to keep the faculty salary gap recommendations as simple and straightforward as possible. Getting bogged down in details risks derailing the process before it begins. He noted that UCAADE Chair Golash-Boza joined with chairs of other systemwide committees to help draft and disseminate the letter from UCFW (included in the background packet).

A recently-convened Retiree Health Task Force is getting underway. The Senate will continue to monitor the status of this important benefit.

5. **Faculty Equity Advisor Program**
   Karie Frasch, Director of UC Berkeley's Office for Faculty Equity & Welfare

Karie Frasch, Director of UC Berkeley's Office for Faculty Equity & Welfare, and UCAADE liaison from the AA/EEO/Diversity Administrators' Group, joined the meeting to discuss that group's progress on formulating recommendations for Faculty Equity Advisor programs. The AA/EEO/Diversity Administrators conducted a survey of the six campuses that have programs to gather best practices. They then drafted a set of recommendations that could be used in a joint statement from the administrative group and UCAADE.

Discussion included whether recommendations would be problematic for campuses that don't have FEA programs or that are still in a pilot phase. One member noted that it is not yet clear that a Faculty Equity Advisor program is the best use of limited funding. Berkeley's model of an Equity Advisor for every department is not feasible for most campuses. Chair Golash-Boza suggested that, at a minimum, UCAADE could recommend that all campuses have an Equity Advisor Program (or an equivalent). UCAADE members also recommended that there be oversight of the program that includes Senate faculty, and that there be ongoing – preferably systemwide – training.

Director Frasch suggested that UCAADE invite Equity Advisors to a future UCAADE meeting to speak about the program.

Next steps: Committee members should review the draft Joint Recommendations for Equity Advisor Programs at the University of California. The current document will be revised to focus on recommendations, rather than issues to be considered.

Once a draft is agreed upon, it will be reviewed by the Office of Academic Personnel and Programs, and then forwarded to the Academic Council.

6. APM 210-1-d and Statements on Contributions to Diversity

UCAADE member Miriam Greenberg (UCSC) described the work of the subcommittee that worked on gathering information on campus uses of statements on contribution to diversity. In addition to Greenberg, the members of the subcommittee are Rommie Amaro (UCSD), Mona Lynch (UCI), and Kathy Julian (UCSF alternate).

There is wide variety in how the instructions in APM 210-1-d, which are for review and appraisal committees, are implemented on each campus. Statements on Contribution to Diversity for *hiring* seem to be universally expected on each campus, but again there is differentiation in implementation.

UCAADE members talked about influencing campus interpretations of APM 210-1-d. Contribution to diversity seems to be rewarded, but lack of contribution (or a statement on contribution) is not punished. There may be lack of understanding of what contribution to diversity can mean, and even though guidelines exist, additional education and outreach may be necessary.

Committee members emphasized that the statement needs to be meaningful. It cannot be just lip-service.

Next steps: Committee members will look for alignment between diversity statements in hiring and diversity statements for review and promotion. The committee will formulate separate recommendations for each situation, develop best practices and rubrics for evaluation, and will work together with UCAP on a potential joint proposal.

7. Provost Michael Brown

Provost Michael Brown joined the meeting to discuss challenges and possible solutions in achieving greater diversity of the faculty. Chair Golash-Boza described UCAADE's interest in Faculty Equity Advisor programs and statements on contribution to diversity.

➢ UCAADE would like to see the **Faculty Equity Advisor** program expanded systemwide, with systemwide support for an annual training workshop and sharing of best practices.
➢ Most campuses require or request **a statement on contribution to diversity** from faculty job applicants, and the inclusion of contribution to diversity statements during the promotion process can impel faculty members to engage in campus diversity.

Provost Brown, who was Academic Council Chair in 2007-08, said that he believes improving diversity at UC is one of his mandates as Provost. He believes that President Napolitano has a strong commitment to diversity and is willing to back that up. The group agreed that leadership matters a great deal, and prioritization needs to happen at top levels. Discussion included the communication between EVCs and deans, and how decision-makers could be incentivized and held accountable.

Further discussion with the Provost included issues such as faculty pipeline, the recent campus diversity initiatives, and the impact on faculty of the cost of housing. Lack of a diverse faculty puts pressure on those faculty members from underrepresented groups for mentoring and service. Additional responsibilities can

make it more difficult to progress past the associate professor level, which leads to the inequities seen in the UC system. Some UCAADE members are frustrated by the many claims of dedication to diversity over the years and lack of results. The UC Davis CAAD has proposed a funding mechanism to reward faculty who are providing extra service and dedicating time to diversity activities like mentoring.

If UCAADE has ideas more, the Provost would like to hear them.

8. **Consultation with UCOP Office of Academic Personnel and Programs**
   Susan Carlson, Vice Provost
   Amy K. Lee, Diversity, Labor and Employee Relations Director

Statements on contribution to diversity: Discussion included the various ways the statements are used at hire and for promotion and tenure review on the campuses. They may be required, or used as extra credit..

VP Carlson noted that UCAP tends to be fairly conservative on this issue, and may not believe that change is necessary. She recommended that UCAADE reach out to UCSD Engineering Professor Pamela Cosman, who is studying contributions to diversity statements at hire.

Action: UCAADE will gather more information about Professor Cosman's work and will follow up with UCAP to draft recommendations. Any recommendations will be shared with VP Carlson before being finalized.

Faculty Equity Advisors: VP Carlson noted that UC Davis uses STEAD ("strength through equity and diversity") training for faculty search committees. UC Davis has found it useful as it forces everyone to be on same page. Faculty members hold workshops and provide information and advice to faculty and administrators involved in hiring. Merced FEA faculty go to Irvine for FEA training or to Davis for STEAD training (which is similar).

President's Postdoctoral Fellows Program: VP Carlson reported that in December the President released a memo lifting the cap on the yearly number of PPFP hiring incentive awards, and subsequently the Provost eliminated the restriction on Health Science and Professional School eligibility.

Advancing Faculty Diversity Initiatives update: The four proposals chosen for the new one-time diversity funding were: Berkeley Engineering; UCSB Economics; Irvine Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics; and UCSF (across all four schools, with a focus on biomedical ladder-rank faculty).

UC Davis is continuing its Campos program, which was originally funded through the NSF. Conversations have now begun regarding modeling a program for hiring African American faculty using similar methods.

Questioned about expanding the initiatives, VP Carlson said it would remain a competition for now. The goal is to eventually reach out to each campus, but campuses must be ready to act. UCAADE members suggested that schools and departments that serve a greater number of first-generation and underrepresented student populations could be recognized for their efforts. Monetary incentives for faculty mentors, or for departments that improve diversity, would help to show that the work is valued. All agreed that money can make a difference, but leadership and accountability are also needed.

Meeting adjourned at 4:05pm
Meeting minutes drafted by Joanne Miller
Attest: Tanya Golash-Boza, UCAADE Chair

Meeting Participants:
Tanya Golash-Boza (Chair, UCM) Lok Siu (Vice Chair, UCB), Bruce Haynes (UCD), Mona Lynch (UCI), Anna Taylor (UCLA alternate, via phone), Clarissa Nobile (UCM, via phone), Suveen Mathaudau (UCR) Rommie Amaro (UCSD), Jae Sevelius (UCSF), Vickie Scott (UCSB), Miriam Greenberg (UCSC) Shane N. White (Academic Council Chair), Robert May (Academic Council Vice Chair), Sophie Armen (Graduate Student, UCSD, via phone), Davon Thomas (Undergraduate Student, UCSC), Joanne Miller (Committee Analyst), Michael Brown (Provost & Executive Vice President), Susan Carlson (Vice Provost for Academic Personnel and Programs, UCOP) Amy K. Lee (Diversity, Labor and Employee Relations Director, UCOP), Pamela Peterson (Executive Director and Deputy to the Vice Provost, UCOP), Karie Frasch (Office for Faculty Equity & Welfare Director, UC Berkeley)