

Minutes of Meeting**Thursday, October 10, 2013****10:00 a.m. – 4:00 p.m.****UCOP, 1111 Franklin Street, Oakland – Room 11326****Primary Dial-In: 1-866-740-1260 | Passcode: 9879466**<http://www.universityofcalifornia.edu/senate/>**I. Chair's Report/Announcements/Updates – Chair Emily Roxworthy**

- **Introductions and Overview.** Chair Roxworthy welcomed the new and returning members of UCAAD and thanked them for their participation and attendance. She noted that UCAAD does not yet have a vice chair and encouraged members to consider undertaking that role. She invited self-introductions from members and sharing why they had chosen to work on UCAAD. The Chair opened her updates with a brief overview of UCAAD, including its relatively recent representation on the Academic Council. She noted that she and Academic Council Chair William Jacob foresee a more active role for UCAAD in response to concerns about the University's commitment to diversity, particularly within the student body.
- **September 25 Academic Council Meeting.** Chair Roxworthy reviewed the discussion at Council meeting, much of which was concerned with the presidential transition. She said that President Napolitano has been meeting regularly with AB 540 students during her campus visits. Feedback indicates that those meetings are going well and that the President seems genuine in her concern for diversity. President Napolitano will have visited all the campuses by the end of November. Chair Roxworthy observed that the President typically meets with the Senate leadership on each campus for an hour, and that meeting provides a good opportunity to express concerns. The Council meeting also focused on faculty welfare and the recent changes to benefits. Chair Roxworthy noted that these changes had potential diversity implications in terms of ageism; it is felt that little information was directed to retirees. Chair Roxworthy discussed legislation that asks for UC and CSU 2014-15 budgets to be tied to performance metrics. There is concern that pressure to reduce time to degree may lead institutions to only accept students they prejudge as able to achieve their degrees quickly and that this prejudgment has diversity implications. In response to a question, Chair Roxworthy observed that there are pervasive rumors that the results of last year's climate study are cause for apprehension. The committee discussed speculation regarding the yet-unseen campus and systemwide reports and stated that UCAAD should be prepared to make a statement about the data and concerns about the methodology once they are released.
- **October 25 UC ADVANCE PAID Roundtable** (NSF-sponsored program designed to recruit, retain, and advance female faculty in the STEM fields). The fourth ADVANCE PAID workshop will be held October 25 at UCSD and will be tied to APM 210-1.d. Chair Roxworthy encouraged members to attend, and noted that the campuses should have funding to cover travel expenses. The Chair said that she would share workshop notes and outcomes with members who are unable to attend.

Chair's Report/Announcements/Updates *(continued)*

- **Continuation of UCAAD liaison-role to BOARS** (Board on Admissions and Relations with Schools) to provide a means for regular consultation between the two committees on issues related to student diversity. Chair Roxworthy explained that UCAAD had recently been asked for a committee liaison to BOARS. She served as the liaison last year, and noted that participation was by telephone and was only needed on items relevant to diversity. Similarly, UCAAD will also need a **liaison to CCGA** to enhance graduate student diversity (including efforts to advance the UC-HSIs Initiative and Proposal to Establish a Regents Diversity Fellowship). She told the members that both committees are very interesting and are closely related to diversity from the student perspective. **Ivan Evans** (UCSD Alternate) agreed to be the liaison to CCGA and Chair Roxworthy will continue as BOARS liaison until another UCAAD member volunteers to replace her.

II. Consent Calendar

- Approval of the Agenda

ACTION: *The agenda with modifications to the sequence of discussion.*

III. Overview of Committee Charge, Processes, Member Roles and Responsibilities, and Resources – Chair Roxworthy and Members

Chair Roxworthy said that UCAAD can be more involved in the goings-on of Academic Council; she recommended that the committee identify issues more proactively and bring them to Council rather than waiting to be given issues to review. She suggested that the committee do more investigative work in asking for data and identifying issues. The Chair noted that it would be helpful to have the minutes from local committee meetings for the systemwide committee. A few members reported that minutes are not taken on their campuses due to a lack of staff support. Committees that keep formal meeting minutes can forward these to the Committee Analyst to be uploaded on SharePoint.

The committee discussed a letter from former President Yudof to the Chancellors about the Faculty Diversity Workgroup recommendations. Members agreed that more accountability was needed at the Dean and Chair-level regarding efforts to recruit and retain diverse faculty. It was suggested that Chairs and Deans be required to demonstrate progress as a regular aspect of their appointment, review, and evaluation. Chair Roxworthy pointed out that APM 240 and 245 already exist to mandate the evaluation of these supervisors' contributions to diversity but that these policies are not being fully implemented. The composition of key senate committees is also an area for concern. The process by which new members are appointed is viewed with some suspicion. Members stressed that junior faculty need to have access to committee membership but also need to be protected from over-extension due to the small pool of diverse faculty being repeatedly asked to diversify committees. Members were also confused as to how service is rewarded and recognized and also how members are held accountable for committee participation.

The committee discussed the importance of cluster hiring and its proven track record in the recruitment and retention of diverse faculty. The Chair told the committee that UC Regent Fred Ruiz was very receptive to the idea when he met with UCAAD last year. The expense associated with cluster hiring, however, has prevented its implementation on the campuses to date.

Overview of Committee Charge, Processes, Member Roles and Responsibilities, and Resources *(continued)*

Chair Roxworthy noted that immediate past chair of UCAAD Manuela Martins-Green approached UCAP regarding authoring a white paper to accompany the proposed revisions to APM 210-1.d that the two committees were involved with last year. While UCAP did not agree to co-author such a white paper, Chair Roxworthy expressed her interest in securing UCAP (and divisional CAP) support in strengthening the rollout of the 210-1.d revisions, and the committee discussed the advisability of submitting a white paper versus a position statement. Members expressed their concern as to why 210-1.d was not well or fully implemented.

IV. Review of 2012-13 UCAAD Annual Report – *Chair Roxworthy and Members*

Chair Roxworthy observed that greater sharing of information and minutes will be helpful in creating an accurate annual report at the end of the academic year.

Chair Roxworthy told the committee that the Negotiated Salary Plan trial program is a way for UC to make salaries more competitive through grant funds and external funding. She noted that it has potential for bias in how the salary component is negotiated, and the process may not be transparent. As it goes through the trial process, UCAAD will need to ensure that the plan is being equitably applied.

A new attachment regarding the Pay Equity Study was emailed this morning to the committee. Each campus had been asked to respond to the study UCAAD conducted a few years ago. The methodology was vetted, but the data was aggregated to target gender inequities rather than racial ones. Each campus submitted response plan to UCAAD, UCAP, and UCFW, and all three committees asked for expanded versions of these plans to be resubmitted by November 15.

V. Executive Session (minutes were not taken for this portion of the meeting)

- **Priority and Goal Setting for 2013-14**

VI. Announcements from the President's Office – *Vice Provost Susan Carlson, Academic Personnel*

The Vice Provost remarked that the ADVANCE PAID workshop in October will be a strong program and will feature good representation from a cross-section of UC. She told the members that the **President's Post-Doctoral Fellowship Program** (PPFP) has 65 fellows this year; these fellows are supported by additional funds permanently committed by former President Yudof. In addition, former senate chair Robert Powell reestablished UC's connection with the three national laboratories to recruit fellows, whom the labs will fund. She observed that Provost Dorr has talked about finding a way to think more holistically about the faculty pipeline. UC has fairly rich diversity among undergraduate students but not graduate, professional students, or faculty. The Provost has had conversations with the two UC Student Regents (Cynthia Flores and Sadia Saifuddin), who are interested in this issue. In closing, the Vice Provost noted that the final ADVANCE PAID roundtable will be held at UC Davis on April 23; she and voiced a strong interest in continuing the momentum begun through the roundtables and conversations.

Council Chair Bill Jacob noted that he had a conversation with Regents Flores and Saifuddin and that they will likely contact UCAAD. He said that they are interested in focusing on academic graduate programs and finding ways to help women and URMs adjust to post-graduate education. He advised that Ms. Flores is a voting regent and that UCAAD would be wise to take advantage of their energy on this topic.

VII. Update on UCAAD 2011 Analysis of UC Pay Equity by Sex and, among Men, Ethnicity, 2009-2011 and Review of the first drafts submitted by the Campus Plans on Campus Salary Equity Studies – Chair Roxworthy and Vice Provost Susan Carlson

Last year, along with UCAP and UCFW, UCAAD reviewed the Pay Equity Study Plans submitted by the campuses. Overall, members expressed surprise at the lack of data analysis and implementation strategies in most of the plans. The Academic Council, having received similar messages from the other two committees, wrote a letter to the Vice Provost suggesting that a set of metrics be developed that would provide a consistent approach and allow for comparative analysis. Members will discuss the intersection of these campus remediation plans with this year's Total Re-numeration Study. The Chair acknowledged that there had been several attachments sent in relation to the agenda and asked for members to email her or the Committee Analyst if they were not able to access the most recent attachment sent that morning.

The Vice Provost explained that the Senate was displeased with most of the plans submitted by the campuses and that most lacked methodology for remediation. The campuses are expected to submit more extensive and detailed plans by November.

The Committee discussed the need for an ongoing mechanism for campus review, with the suggestion that campuses submit updated plans every three years. It was felt that regular reporting would help keep campuses on track and allow for more rapid identification and remediation of any problems or obstacles that might exist.

Vice Provost Carlson told the committee that the Negotiated Salary Plan preliminary report should be ready by November and will be disseminated by Council Chair Jacob. Committee members discussed the need to include factors such as research funding in the Total Re-numeration study and that the data should be able to be broken down by race and gender. The committee also expressed concern about the lack of transparency in the retention process. Members said that it should be less opaque and should be interlocked with the Faculty Diversity Workgroup recommendations.

The Vice Provost stressed the importance of the Pay Equity Study being discussed with the President in a timely and strategic manner. She expressed concern that it would be lost in the discussion surrounding the Total Re-numeration Study.

**VIII. Consultation with the Academic Senate Leadership –
William Jacob, Academic Council Chair
Martha Winnacker, Academic Senate Executive Director**

Academic Council Chair Bill Jacob thanked committee members for their service. He spoke about the new President's ongoing campus visits and informed the committee that President Napolitano uses a daily briefing book to keep apprised of events and concerns across UC. He noted that she will be at the next Academic Council meeting and has expressed a strong interest in listening to the thoughts and concerns of UC faculty, staff, and students, including undocumented students. Chair Jacob observed that the recent changes to UC medical benefits are substantial and recommended that committee members refer to *At Your Service* if they had questions.

Chair Jacob commented on the newly formed **UC Enrollment Work Group**, loosely comprised of President Napolitano, UCOP senior-level advisors George Johnson, Debora Obley, Nina Robinson, and Stephen Handel, and himself. The work group has been contemplating enrollment management from many different perspectives and is providing material for the hearing of the Assembly Committee on Higher Education in November.

Consultation with the Academic Senate Leadership *(continued)*

Chair Jacob went on to discuss the **UniversityLink Initiative** at UCSD. UniversityLink is an existing program whereby low-income students from local community colleges can access support services and counseling about how to transfer to UC. The UCSD Chancellor is interested in evolving this program as a transfer pathway for guaranteed admission to UCSD. Such local guarantees, however, have long been against the regulations and contrary to official policy. BOARS will be discussing the possibility and its implications. Chair Jacob observed that the larger issue of transfer likely is going to be an important systemwide focus in the year ahead.

Chair Jacob told the committee that the **UC Interactive Learning Technology Initiative (ILTI)** is moving forward with 32 proposals, but not all of them will be funded.

A committee member asked about **Massive Open Online Courses (MOOCs)** and their impact on URMs. Chair Jacob stated that online education has been proven to be disadvantaged toward URM and low-income students, particularly in developmental or pre-college-level courses. He discussed the failure of a developmental course taught through the for-profit educational organization, **Udacity**, at San Jose State University. He stated that MOOCs are the worst possible way to approach students who are disadvantaged.

Academic Senate Executive Director Martha Winnacker spoke briefly about business services changes that had taken place at UCOP and the resulting adjustment to travel billing and reporting for Senate committee members. She informed the committee that instructions can be found under the Resources and Guidelines section on the Senate website, and asked that members contact her regarding any questions or problems to avoid fruitless back-and-forth within the UC reimbursement system. She reminded the committee that policy bars the Senate from paying for meals for trips under 24-hours and that overnight stays require pre-approval.

XI. Report and Recommendations from the Final Report of Faculty Diversity Working Group – *Chair Roxworthy and Members*

The Faculty Diversity Work Group, a small body appointed by the President's Climate Council, issued its final report and recommendations last year. Chair Roxworthy discussed with members UCAAD's support for the workgroup recommendations, and its call for special emphasis on particular items.

X. UC-HSIs (Hispanic Serving Institutions) Initiative and Proposal to Establish a Regents Diversity Fellowship – *Chair Roxworthy and Members*

As proposed, the UC-HSI Initiative UCOP will incentivize UC faculty and campus departments to develop long-term relationships with HSIs, particularly faculty members and programs that are a good fit with particular UC graduate programs and faculty. Modeled after the recently launched UC-HBCU Initiative, UCOP will invite proposals from UC faculty members at each of the ten campuses who would like to host and immerse students from HSIs in UC research training internships during the summer and develop an ongoing project of collaboration and engagement with students and faculty from partnering HSIs. The goal of this efforts is to help UC graduate programs mine talent and support student achievement at institutions that are less represented in UC admission pools, as well as support collaboration opportunities for UC faculty.

UC-HSIs (Hispanic Serving Institutions) Initiative and Proposal to Establish a Regents Diversity Fellowship *(continued)*

Graduate Studies Director Pamela Jennings updated the committee on institutional efforts to coordinate with Hispanic Serving Institutions (HSI), modeled on the success of the Historically Black Colleges and Universities (HBCU) program UC initiated in 2011. Four UC campuses have been designated HSI. Ms. Jennings noted that one of the action items needed to move forward is the appointment of a UCAAD liaison to CCGA; UC has not paid as much attention to graduate diversity as it has to faculty diversity. Engagement of graduate students has been a key to the success of the HBCU initiative. Chair Roxworthy asked for feedback regarding the HSI proposal by October 28; otherwise it will be assumed to be accepted as-is.

XI. Consultation with UCAP on Proposed Changes to APM 210-1.d and Preparation by UCAAD of a Senate-issued White Paper – *Chair Roxworthy and Vice Provost Carlson*

Last year, UCAAD and UCAP worked together to improve the efficacy of APM 210.1.d. This discussion was an outgrowth of complaints from several faculty members who argued that research in diversity is not given the same value as other types of research at UC. After extensive back-and-forth, the committees agreed on the language except for one specific aspect hence each committee submitted its own verbiage to the Academic Council. The Academic Council then reviewed both languages and was able to reach a consensus. The new language of APM 210.1-d was then forwarded to Provost Dorr for her consideration to send the new APM 210.1-d out for review by the divisions the coming year. UCAAD also felt strongly that the change to APM 210.1.d should be substantiated by a white paper that would underscore the importance of contributions to diversity. UCAP was approached by UCAAD to co-author such a paper, but declined. The committee agreed that UCAAD would continue this effort into next year. This topic largely was discussed earlier. A PowerPoint from Susan Rivera will be distributed to the committee.

ACTION: *There were three separate actions: First, members were asked to locate the most recent annual report from their respective AADs to their Divisional chairs as well as any relevant campus reports on the subject of mentoring junior faculty. Second, Grace Tonner (UCI) volunteered to compile a list of best practices in place Systemwide for Chairs and Department Chairs on the same topic. And third, members were asked for their help with collecting from their respective COCs on the composition of local divisional senate committees and also on any relevant anecdotal information to help gauge faculty participation-levels and expand current understanding of service loads, both how recognized and rewarded, and on the relationship of Senate service to the rates of faculty advancement, over the long-haul (periods of service can tend to fragment research and scholarship, for instance).*

XII. Roundtable: Campus Updates – *Committee Members*

This item was postponed due to time limitations.

XIII. New Business

There were no new business items.

Adjournment:

The meeting was adjourned at 4:00 p.m.

Attest: Emily Roxworthy, Chair
Prepared by: Analyst Fredye Harms

UCAAD 2013-14 Remaining Meeting Schedule:

January 16, 2014 – Room 5320

April 18, 2014 – Room 5320

June 20, 2014 – Room 5320