UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA   **ACADEMIC SENATE**

UNIVERSITY COMMITTEE ON AFFIRMATIVE ACTION, DIVERSITY, AND EQUITY
Thursday, January 24, 2019

Meeting Minutes

1. Agenda review, approval of meeting minutes from October
Lok Siu, UCAADE Chair
Mona Lynch, UCAADE Vice Chair

UCAADE members were pleased to be joined by the undergraduate representative (via video) and graduate representative (in person) to the committee. After introductions, the committee heard reports about the various accomplishments and related activities since the last meeting:

- Oct. 23 Diversity Hearing – Chair Lok Siu participated in a hearing of the California State Assembly's Higher Education Committee on October 23. Representatives from UC and CSU reported on the status of faculty diversity and the funding provided by the legislature for Advancing Faculty Diversity initiatives. The takeaway was that UC needs to do more.
- On Oct. 26, the Academic Council approved UCAADE's President's Postdoctoral Fellowship Program recommendations. The President's Postdoctoral Fellowship Program will receive a portion of President Napolitano's faculty diversity funding. Chair Siu mentioned that the latest PPFP Annual Report (2017-18) had been circulated by PPFP Director Mark Lawson.
- On Oct. 31, UCAADE Vice Chair Mona Lynch participated in a day-long UC Faculty Salary Equity Survey gathering at UCOP. The meeting focused on measurement, metrics, and the extent of coordination that is desirable between campuses. Many different methodologies were used in the past five years, making it difficult to compare the surveys across campuses. The biggest difference among the surveys was about using step and rank as control variables. In the end, the meeting participants agreed on using at least some common elements in the surveys so that they may be compared.
- Chair Siu is participating in a joint CSU/UC Anti-Bias Training Initiative Working Group that is funded by the legislature. The group is developing a call for proposals for a pilot program for anti-bias training. A separate work group is developing criteria for evaluating proposals when they come in. The actual pilot program will begin in the fall for the academic year.
- UCAADE has requested that the UC Office of Diversity and Engagement look into the role of campus Chief Diversity Officers. The roles and responsibilities of CDOs seem to vary greatly by campus. The topic will be on the UCAADE agenda in March.
- UCAADE's recommendations for Statements on Contributions to Diversity were fully endorsed during the January 23rd Academic Council meeting. After the initial work of UCAADE and the EO/AA/Diversity Officers Group on the recommendations, there were then extensive negotiations with UCFW and UCAP. The final document will be sent to the systemwide Provost and Divisional Chairs to send to campuses.

Meeting minutes from Oct. 11, 2018 were approved with minor corrections.

2. Member reports

UC Berkeley: The local committee deals very broadly with campus climate. Recent concerns include adequate support for transfer students, earlier and more frequent outreach to local communities, foodbanks and food insecurity, and what is going on with retirements and hiring at UC Berkeley. There is much focus on STEM fields on campus, to the potential detriment of other disciplines.

UC Davis: The local committee is exploring a fellowship or other type of funding for faculty who mentor or spend significant time working with URM populations and have slipped in their research. The committee was asked by the faculty Senate to figure out how these faculty who are spending time on activities not recognized by the step system can be assisted. The committee would like to support three URM student success centers – African American, Latinx, and Native American – that lost their funding. New faculty hired out of the President's Postdoctoral Fellowship Program (PPFP) have been required to go through a CAP review before hiring and the local committee has asked for it to be removed. The local committee will also join other faculty committees in looking into campus responses to poor air quality due to large scale fires.

UCLA: The local committee has been discussing and further disseminating guidance on "equity, diversity, and inclusion" (EDI) statements for faculty review and promotion. The Office for Equity, Diversity & Inclusion's website has a number of resources, including a supplementary FAQ document (link is in the [news item](#)). The committee reviewed a public accountability report about SVSH (sexual violence sexual harassment) complaints and resolutions. One issue that came up was question about hugging and the acceptance in different cultures. UCLA has an awards program that recognizes exceptional work by faculty in diversity.

UC Merced: UC Merced has also instituted a Senate-level diversity award for $1,000 that will be funded annually by the EVC. The campus will be hiring about 100 new faculty members in the next couple of years and the local committee wants to make diversity an important component of the hiring decisions, with a goal that 20 percent of new hires will be reserved for "diversity" hires. The committee has been concerned about hiring in STEM fields, which led to a process that resulted in the hiring of an Associate Vice Provost for Faculty Diversity and also to plans for more targeted hiring efforts. The Rules Committee is looking at recommendations for voting policies in departments. Some allow every member of faculty to vote on all cases, regardless of rank, while others use "at or below your rank" as the standard.

UC Riverside: UC Riverside has implemented an equity advisor program this year with one or two advisors per college. The advisors are faculty, receive extra remuneration, and are provided with diversity training from the Office of Diversity, Equity and Inclusion. The local committee is going to explore how COC assigns faculty members to committees, and if/how diversity is taken into account. A Faculty Welfare survey that was prompted by last year's exodus of MRU faculty will be completed by end of year.

UC San Diego: A document concerning diversity, equity and inclusion (DEI) statements for evaluation and promotion as well as hiring will be endorsed by the faculty Senate. Guidance covers what might be included, such as service and other activities that are hard to capture or might be overlooked. The local committee has had to deal with the issue of whether the guidance indicates that a "fourth leg" for diversity has been added, or if it is something that runs through all criteria. UCSD has a DEI course requirement, which has resulted in various types of pushback including negative student feedback for the instructors. The local committee wants to support the faculty and TAs who teach those courses and will start by looking at data. A new topic concerns the student disability office. There are many more students who report having

disabilities than who take advantage of the office. The proposed Title IX revisions from the federal government provoked a strong letter condemning the changes. Recent data shows that the graduation rate at UCSD is lower than it should be, and there is a gap that may have to do with challenges for transfer students in getting into their preferred major due to impacted STEM majors.

UCSF: UCSF is promoting the incorporation of diversity, equity, and inclusion (DEI) statements into the merit and promotion process. The CAP is sympathetic, but is dealing with a large backlog and is hesitant to add more material to be reviewed. A National Academies report noted that women, women of color, and those who identify as LGBT face discrimination, so the UCSF local committee is working with the Vice Chancellor of Diversity and Outreach to review policies, practices, and initiatives that would help change behavior. A faculty member looking at data and how to possibly recruit more URM/women into the basic sciences. The campus has held workshops on free speech for all UCSF faculty members. The local committee has asked for more money for National Center for Diversity Training Boot Camp. The committee previously sent three participants and now have money for four. The next request will be for funding for a diversity award. The campus has held day-long sessions for diversity "champion" training. Twenty percent of each department in the School of Medicine is expected to attend. The attendees are mainly women, LGBT, and URM.

UC Santa Barbara: A Chancellor-funded faculty diversity award was unanimously approved after a 20-month process. The recipient gets a plaque and check for $1,000. The committee hopes to increase the number of annual awards to six. Currently, funding for a second award has been promised by the Associate Vice Chancellor for Diversity. The campus is working on using Equity Advisors for searches. Understanding that the idea for FEA is gaining ground systemwide has made the campus more receptive to it. In the department of Theater and Dance the question of "intimacy training" has come up.

Graduate student issues: Graduate student Monica Cornejo reported that there is concern that undocumented graduate students are not able to get jobs as teaching assistants. At UCSB, the availability of gender neutral bathrooms has become an issue, as they are not in every building. Students are interested in mentorship for graduate students of color and first generation students that would include how to navigate the system, mental health, work-life balance, and more. The high cost of housing is also an issue.

Undergraduate student issues: Undergraduate representative Lennin Kuri is part of the Student Association (UCSA) at UC Riverside and has access to statistics at the campus. Faculty and staff retention is a big issue for students since they lose their teachers and mentors. Food insecurity is also a big issue at UC Riverside, where apparently 62 percent of the student population is food insecure. There is concern that President Napolitano is not funding undocumented student programs. The Student Association found the recently released Governor's Budget to be generous in some areas but with room for improvement.

In discussion after the campus and student updates, committee members expressed serious concern about students getting enough to eat. Kuri was asked to bring more data and some proposals/solutions to the next meeting. The topic of food insecurity for students will be put on the agenda for the next meeting.[1]

The topic of teaching evaluations also came up. It is currently being discussed in UCAP and a working group may be formed. UCAADE will be involved to provide guidance.

---

[1] See UC Global Food Initiative: Food and Housing Security at the University of California (December 2017): https://www.ucop.edu/global-food-initiative/_files/food-housing-security.pdf

3. Consultation with UCOP Office of Diversity and Engagement
Elizabeth Halimah, Associate Vice Provost
Tae-Sun Kim, Strategic Diversity Initiatives Manager

Associate Vice Provost Elizabeth Halimah and Strategic Diversity Initiatives Manager Tae-Sun Kim joined the meeting for a discussion about campus climate and the work of the UCOP Office of Diversity and Engagement. AVP Halimah noted that at this time last year, the big issue was controversial speakers on the campuses and the resulting negative campus climate. Meetings were held to discuss how to deal with potentially disruptive events and around free speech issues. The UC administration produced a tool kit for campus-level staff on how to prepare for major events and protests. The UCOP Office of Diversity and Engagement receives incident reports on offensive speech, graffiti, other incidents that may not rise to the systemwide level. The biggest issue was offensive speech due to race.

In addition to the required Clery Act reporting of campus crime statistics, the California State Auditor recently issued a request for information from UC on non-criminal acts of hatred and intolerance. UCOP has asked campuses to send reports.

The Governor's Budget includes $1.2 million for anti-bias training for administers, faculty, and student leaders for UC and CSU. A workgroup that includes UCAADE Chair Lok Siu is now developing an RFP that will come out in March/April. There is already a lot of training available, so the idea is to best complement existing material.

In 2012-13 there was a survey of campus climate at UC, which was the largest of its kind in the US and provided rich data down to the departmental level. But, it was very time-consuming and very expensive. Some campuses have done their own surveys since then (UCSF, eg). If there is to be another systemwide survey, it might be shorter, more concise, and done in-house rather than with an outside expert. While campuses made changes in response to the survey results and continue to implement plans, there is no regular reporting required. The position of Campus Diversity Officer was one result of the survey. Committee members and AVP Halimah agreed that it might be worthwhile to have a periodic check-in every 3-4 years.

Overall, the 2012-13 survey showed that three out of four respondents were comfortable with the climate -- meaning that one of four were not. The closest reporting right now is the UC Undergraduate Experience Survey (UCUES), which includes questions about feeling respected. The results of those surveys can be found in the [Accountability Report](#).

UCAADE members noted that reporting of incidents is a discouraging process. The same problems seem to continue without improvement. All culture change is slow, and academic culture changes very slowly. It is critical to make sure that all levels of the administration, faculty, staff, and students treat diversity as important. Members discussed whether there were ways to engage students to look beyond their own social circle. Some campuses promote this. Campuses have plans, initiatives, trained facilitators and offices that are available to help, but they are sometimes invisible to those who need them most. The administration has to promote them. Members worried that the university was more concerned with protecting the institution than the students.

More information about systemwide efforts (with links to campuses) can be found at:
http://diversity.universityofcalifornia.edu/

4. Consultation with Academic Senate Leadership
   Kum-Kum Bhavnani, Academic Council Vice Chair

Senate Vice Chair Kum-Kum Bhavnani joined the meeting to provide an overview of the current activities of the Senate.

Governor's Budget. UC is generally pleased with the Governor's Budget proposal, which included funding for increased enrollment growth and graduate medical education, as well as a significant amount for deferred maintenance. There will be changes when the revised version of the budget is released in May.

Standardized testing. President Napolitano requested that the Senate look at the role of standardized testing in admissions for undergraduates. Former BOARS Chair Henry Sanchez is chairing a task force that will gather input from experts, the testing industry, etc. Many people are interested in this topic and the results will no doubt receive publicity. An interim report is due by the end of the academic year.

Union negotiations with librarians and other non-faculty academic personnel around Academic freedom. A working group has been formed to develop protections, rights, and responsibilities for non-Senate librarians and other non-faculty academic personnel. This is in lieu of academic freedom conferred by the APM on faculty. The group is chaired by Academic Council Chair Robert May and includes faculty and representatives from the librarian leadership. Robert Post, a faculty expert on academic freedom, will consult.

Elsevier negotiations. UC's license with Elsevier expired on Dec. 31, but the license was extended for a month as negotiations around pricing and open access continue. Germany and Sweden have cancelled their licenses and that option is possible for UC. If Elsevier cuts off access to their journals the university has arranged for alternate access via interlibrary loan and other means.

Background checks. An issue came to the Academic Council regarding background checks for faculty applicants. This is a privacy issue that did not go through Senate consultation. The understanding is that it was implemented to help mitigate serial harassment.

Chancellors' Statement on Israel Boycott. An undated statement signed by all ten Chancellors was issued regarding their opposition of boycotts against Israel. Some Chancellors consulted with their Academic Senates (UCSB and UCD) but others did not. Because the Chancellors' document is seen as a university position, some faculty are concerned.

Fully online major in Business Administration at UCI. UC Irvine has a proposal for a fully online major in Business Administration. Part of the justification is the lack of space on campus. The major is geared toward transfer students. Many issues have come up, including tuition, whether students can use campus resources, and the quality of education.

Scrutiny into self-supporting programs. There is recent scrutiny into self-supporting programs (graduate programs), including resources used, diversity, and faculty. They have generally been found to be not as diverse as other programs. The proposals brought to the Board of Regents are provoking strong opinions among the Regents, especially the newly appointed members of the board. A portion of the tuition from these programs is supposed to be returned to aid. Systemwide, CCGA and UCPB are examining the variables. UCAADE may also wish to be more engaged.

Transfer guarantee. Work continues for a guarantee of transfer to UC for students from community colleges who complete specified requirements. A key element of the plan, which is based on an MOU signed by the President, will be communication to the right audience and broadly getting the word out.

5. Faculty Equity Advisor Program
Lok Siu, UCAADE Chair

Guest: Karie Frasch, Director of the UC Berkeley Office for Faculty Equity & Welfare, and UCAADE liaison from the AA/EEO/Diversity Officers' Group (via video)

Karie Frasch, Director of UC Berkeley's Office for Faculty Equity & Welfare, joined the meeting for a strategy discussion on the recommendations for improvements/expansion to Faculty Equity Advisor programs. These recommendations are meant to provide advice and ideas for Faculty Equity Advisors, particularly for those campuses that have not yet started programs. UC Riverside and UC Merced just started their programs, and UC Santa Cruz has a similar program. At UCSF, FEAs are involved only in hiring.

The committee reviewed the latest draft of the joint recommendations with the EO/AA group, and determined that it needed significant revision, including adding more about accountability and strengthening the recommendations. There were questions about the involvement of Equity Advisors in the merit and promotion process, and around issues of confidentiality. At Irvine, for example, the FEAs are involved with salary and equity evaluations with Deans. UCI has "Diverse Educational Community and Doctoral Experience" (DECADE) advisors that work in collaboration with the Office of Inclusive Excellence to provide UCI graduate students with a supportive community of faculty, staff, and students.

UC Berkeley's Office for Faculty Equity & Welfare is not replicated on other campuses, and it might not be clear which administrative office would oversee an FEA program. Discussion of empowerment and accountability for FEA programs touched on whether the document should include a recommendation for a mechanism or supervisory position that can intervene if necessary in a search situation (for example). The committee also briefly discussed metrics and how public they should be. There was consensus that one of the recommendations should be that FEAs be tenured faculty and have some demonstrated interest/knowledge in diversity issues.

A small subcommittee of Lok Siu, Asmeret Berhe, and Javier Arsuaga, along with Karie Frasch, will work on revising the current draft recommendations. More introduction will be added to the narrative in the first section to describe FEA programs, including examples of what campuses are doing that might be worth replicating.

6. Systemwide Review Items

Due to changes in law, UC has made technical revisions to sections of the Academic Personnel Manual (APM) that cover leaves of absence and accommodations for childbearing and childrearing (Sections 710, 715, 730, and 760). Another more comprehensive revision will be coming next year.

7. Consultation with UCOP Office of Academic Personnel and Programs
Susan Carlson, Vice Provost
Amy K. Lee, Diversity, Labor and Employee Relations Director

- Report on the latest year's data of separations and retirements (if available)

A detailed report on the latest year's data of separations and retirements is not yet available, but Vice Provost Carlson reported that data shows overall hiring of women and URM, which had been at 17 percent two years ago, is back down to 14 percent. She intends to find out the breakdown by discipline.

VP Carlson mentioned an upcoming workshop at UC Davis in April on "Achieving Equity & Diversity in Faculty Recruitment - Research & Practice." It is a national convening of diversity and faculty recruitment researchers and all UCAADE members are invited to attend. An invitation to register was sent to UCAADE members earlier in the day.

- Advancing Faculty Diversity Initiatives

The $2million for Advancing Faculty Diversity comes directly from the legislature to UC. In each of the last three years, UC ran a competition for measureable campus pilot interventions in specific units. Funding from the President may allow for continuation of some of the pilots. A small amount of funding this year that is going toward pilot programs for retention and climate.

- Faculty Diversity Funding from President Napolitano

VP Carlson reminded the committee that President Napolitano has committed an ongoing $7.1m per year to faculty diversity efforts (with a small amount going toward graduate student diversity), starting next year. This year, UC has $2m from the legislature that is being used for retention and climate initiatives at six campuses. Some will be spent on the UC-HBCU program. As a side note, it was observed that the schools proposing pilot programs for the legislative funding have received a lot of money, even though they may have the worst records for diverse hiring. Approximately $2m in new funding will be spent on the President's Postdoctoral Fellowship Program (PPFP), which will double its current budget. Almost all of the PPFP funding will be used for additional fellows, with a small amount for administrative support. With more fellows accepted, the next step will be to work on increased hiring of fellows into regular faculty positions at UC. A new proposal asks for small start-up funding for hired fellows.

Many faculty play an important in PPFP: as selectors, mentors, external reviewers, and serving on the advisory committee. Fellows in the President's Postdoctoral Fellowship Program generally have to go through standard search procedures, but may be eligible for a search waiver.

VP Carlson is currently gathering input on how the additional funding for faculty diversity should be spent. She and UCOP colleagues will talk with leaders on all ten campuses about their ideas. UCAADE is also welcome to provide input. Although most of the money will go to the campuses, VP Carlson suggested that some could go toward the ongoing exit and retention survey to ensure consistency among campuses.

Ideas for possible interventions included:

- Attention to search committee composition
- Broaden the scope or composition of who makes the final hiring decision
- Making use and evaluation of DEI statements first and foremost
- Changes to rubrics and evaluation process
- Equity Advisor Programs
- Change conversation about qualifications to look at potential, rather than experience
- Make sure that all applicant files are read and considered using a standard ranking system or rubrics

- Ideas for strengthening the pipeline - using funding for undergraduate programs, awards, research opportunities etc.

Action: UCAADE will prepare a list of ideas for use of funding for faculty diversity and will share it with VP Carlson by April 1st.

- Potential changes to UC's Guidance for Evaluating Contributions to Diversity for Faculty Appointment and Promotion Under APM – 210

The committee asked VP Carlson about the likelihood of making changes to APM 210-1-d, and the accompanying guidelines. The last revision of APM 210-1-d took three years. Changes to the guidance document can be done much more easily. If UCAADE wants to propose changes, specific language is helpful.

- New gender identity questions in UCPath

VP Carlson and Director Amy Lee wanted to alert UCAADE that there are new questions on gender identity and self-identification in UCPath. UCAADE learned about this last year. The intention is to collect information on gender identity that is not binary, which cannot be done now. The rollout began with implementation on student questionnaires, but the employee version was holding for UCPath readiness, which took a while longer. The UCPath self-identification questions should be going live in March, for those locations using UCPath. The questionnaire was supposed to be part of a guided on-boarding process, but will now be part of the self-service portal. FAQs will be available to explain what it's all about.

Meeting adjourned at 4:05pm
Meeting minutes drafted by: Joanne Miller, UCAADE Committee Analyst
Attest: Lok Siu, UCAADE Chair

UCAADE attendees: Lok Siu (Chair, UCB), Mona Lynch (Vice Chair, UCI), Michael Nylan (UCB), Javier Arsuaga (UCD), Antoinette Gomes (UCLA), Asmeret Berhe (UCM), Boris Maciejovsky (UCR), Michael Trigilio (UCSD, via video), Christine Glastonbury (UCSF), Vickie Scott (UCSB), Monica Cornejo (Graduate Student Representative, UCSB), Lennin Kuri, Undergraduate Student Representative, UCR), Kum-Kum Bhavnani (Academic Senate Vice Chair)

Consultants, Guests, and Staff: Elizabeth Halimah (UCOP), Tae-Sun Kim (UCOP), Susan Carlson (UCOP), Amy K. Lee (UCOP), Karie Frasch (Director of the UC Berkeley Office for Faculty Equity & Welfare, via video) Joanne Miller (Committee Analyst)