

Meeting Minutes

1. Chair's Announcements, approval of meeting minutes

UCAADE Chair Mona Lynch and Vice Chair Javier Arsuaga updated the committee on some of the ongoing activities of the Academic Senate, including:

- The UC presidential search process

UCAADE's recommendations regarding the criteria for a new president were conveyed to the Regents' Special Committee that is conducting the search. Open forums and town halls are now being held on campuses.

- Standardized Testing Task Force update

The Task Force's report will be finished soon and discussed at next week's Academic Council meeting. There will then be a systemwide Academic Senate review. UCAADE will have a chance to discuss the report at its March 5th meeting, and to provide feedback after that. Chair Lynch is a member of the Standardized Testing Task Force.

- Teaching Evaluation Task Force update

Chair Lynch is also a member of the Teaching Evaluation Task Force, which is continuing from last year, but with different members. UCAADE is invited by the Task Force to respond to draft recommendations from an administrative group with an endorsement, concerns, or further suggestions.

- New Extending Faculty Diversity Task Force

Elizabeth Abrams will be the UCAADE liaison to a new "Extending Faculty Diversity Task Force." The Task Force was proposed by Academic Council members to take a deeper look into campus diversity efforts.

- Student Basic Needs and Food Insecurity Issues

UC, CSU, and the California Community College system have joined together to form the California Higher Education Basic Needs Alliance (CHEBNA) to facilitate coordination and share best practices among the three segments for addressing students' basic needs, and will hold a conference in February. UCAADE will focus on food insecurity, although other needs have been identified. Members were surprised at survey results that showed upwards of 40 percent of students have food insecurity issues.

At the last UCAADE meeting, members talked about the salary delay issue that affects graduate students at the beginning of the academic year. Although there has apparently been some changes made in the UCPath system to mitigate this, entering graduate students might benefit from knowing about the delay.

The UC Board of Regents has formed a Special Committee on Basic Needs that has been meeting regularly and reporting to the Board.

Committee members briefly discussed the "Wildcat" strike of graduate student at UCSC, which is focused on cost of living increase to help with the high cost of housing in the Santa Cruz area. UCAADE members

talked about whether the committee should address the issue of graduate student support directly. Members were asked to find out about graduate student pay and other forms of support and to report back.

Action: The committee analyst will follow-up regarding information to be gathered.

Action: In response to a request from Academic Council Chair Kum-Kum Bhavnani , UC Merced member Asmeret Berhe volunteered for the interim working group on climate issues to advise on membership for a Senate Task Force on Climate Change.

Action: Meeting minutes from Oct. 17, 2019, were approved with minor edits on campus reports.

2. Draft report from systemwide Teaching and Learning Centers (TLC) group

UCAADE reviewed a draft report from the campus Centers for Teaching and Learning that was forwarded from the Academic Council's Teaching Evaluation Task Force. The report synthesizes efforts underway on each campus to improve teaching evaluations and makes recommendations for improvements to help eliminate bias in the evaluations, which are used for merit and promotion. UCAADE is invited to provide its perspective on the recommendations in the report.

Studies have shown that student course evaluations are often biased against women and faculty from underrepresented groups. The report's recommendations include changing the nature of the questions to be more evaluative, adjusting measurements, more transparency, and adopting other forms of evaluating of teaching effectiveness.

In discussion, it became apparent that campuses handle teaching evaluations in different ways. Campuses are also conducting reviews of their teaching evaluation process. Suggestions included rewards for students for completing (but this can have unintended consequences), educating students about how the evaluations are used, and mandating implicit bias training for all students before completing evaluations. Undergraduate student Natalie Lopez said that students often evaluate the class on the difficulty of the subject matter rather than the teaching.

There is a cumulative effect that occurs due to classes more likely to cover sensitive or emotional issues or provocative topics are more often taught by women and people of color. Instructors who teach required DEI courses, for example, more often receive negative reviews. Another element is students' desires for greater sensitivity from instructors around underrepresented minorities, gender identity, and religion.

Meanwhile, CAPs are overloaded with merit and promotion reviews and trying to streamline their work to get more done. UCAADE members noted that the way the data is consolidated and used is also important.

Action: UCAADE members are asked to add their input to a Google doc, limiting comments to those about how to mitigate bias in teaching evaluations. The content will then be crafted into a letter to the Teaching Evaluation Task Force regarding the draft recommendations.

3. President's Postdoctoral Fellowship Program

Mark Lawson, Director PFPF

PPFP Director Mark Lawson gave a presentation on the history and accomplishments of the President's Postdoctoral Fellowship Program, which was founded in 1984 based on UC Berkeley's Chancellor's Fellowship Program. The two-year fellowship program provides salary, travel funds, retreats and workshops, protected research time, and support in hiring negotiations, and currently supports approximately 50 fellows. The hiring incentive was instituted in 2003 to try to boost hiring of fellows into UC positions. It provides \$85,000/year for 5 years (for a total of \$425,000) for each PFPF/CPF hired into a ladder-rank equivalent position. These funds go to the campus and are not tied to FTE or salary; they may be used for salary support, startup, or other departmental or campus uses. The latest news is that President Napolitano is providing \$1.3 million to augment start-up funds for PFPF and Chancellors' Fellows Program (CFP) fellows who are hired into UC ladder-rank faculty positions. The program will be modeled on the 2014-2017 program in which the President allocated \$2.4M to support STEM start-up packages for PFPF and CFP fellows. The funds can be used for current hiring.

The program now receives over 1,000 applications this year. Partner programs at other universities pay a fee for back-end support via an online system for application review and share information on open positions.

Committee members discussed what appears to be a low rate of PFPF hiring at UC Berkeley. Director Lawson says that the campus has been trying to address this loss, and sees various causes – for lack of hiring at Berkeley and other campuses – including partner hires, competition, and misunderstanding or variability of the use of the hiring incentive and impact on FTE. It may also be a coincidence of the past 5-years window. UCSF was recently included in the hiring program due to the new inclusion of professional schools.

UCAADE members said they see some skepticism from unit heads about whether the PFPF hire will count against their FTEs, and that increased communication from campus leadership would help to increase the hiring rate. Members asked about how campuses use the incentive funds, and whether information about that could be circulated. Some campuses have institutionalized a review of PFPFs as a regular part of the search process. As chairs of local committees, UCAADE members can work with chairs of other local committees to advocate and share information about the program. With more attention on the fellowship program and promotion by some campus leaders in the past few years, there has been a big boost in hiring. The next area of focus will be to provide additional early-career support. Data has shown that fellows hired in to ladder-rank positions generally outperform general hires and have a better rate of tenure. Director Lawson talked about attempts to continue the networking that is provided to fellows. Former fellows are asked to stay involved in the program by reviewing applications, although there is sensitivity to over-burdening early- and mid-career faculty.

UCAADE members asked about the status of retirements at UC. Data has shown that eliminating mandatory retirement has negatively impacted diversity. In addition, some departments are shrinking and may lose an FTE when a faculty member retires.

UCAADE has offered support for the program in the past, and members wanted to know what would be most helpful at this point, after expansion. Director Lawson speculated on the optimal size for the program

and rate of fellows hired into UC ladder rank positions. Lawson thought that the program may be able to grow again in a couple of years. He also noted that some fellows who are hired at other institutions come back, and said that supplemental private funding may be an option at some point.

Members also talked briefly about Chancellor's Fellows and how more resources could be directed toward those programs. More information sharing between the PFP and CFP would also be helpful.

4. Backlash against DEI Statements

UCAADE Vice Chair Javier Arsuaga provided some background for the discussion about responses to UC's use of statements on diversity, equity, and inclusion (DEI) for academic positions and in the review and promotion process. A UC Davis mathematics professor – from Arsuaga's department – wrote a letter to the Mathematical Society Journal speaking out against UC's use of DEI statements. The letter was reported on and reprinted elsewhere, and the author was interviewed by the Wall Street Journal. UC Davis Chancellor May wrote a response, but more questions have come from UC Davis and UC Berkeley regarding the use of DEI Statements. One of the Advancing Faculty Diversity pilot programs at UC Davis involved the use of statements to help screen job candidates. There has apparently been some campus backlash against this pilot program, with accusations that it was discriminatory.

Criticisms about DEI Statements were voiced when UCAADE's recommendations were issued in February. Many of the concerns are addressed in that document,¹ including inadvertently disadvantaging international applicants who may not know how to write a good statement, the availability of guidelines for writing a statement, and guidelines for assessing statements.

UCAADE discussed whether and how to respond to the criticism. Any response should take into account what the pushback is about. The ability to work with and support a diverse student body is a key competency for faculty at any UC campus.

5. Consultation with UCOP Office of Academic Personnel and Programs

Pamela Peterson, Executive Director and Deputy to the Vice Provost

This item was cancelled.

6. Member reports on local committees, campus CDOs and Faculty Equity Advisor Programs

As part of the regular local committee round-robin, members were asked to talk about the role of the Chief Diversity Officer and status of the Faculty Equity Advisory program on their campus.

UCSF: UCSF's local committee is working on bringing equity and inclusion to searches for leadership positions, including chief physicians and others. Women and URM are often left out of consideration. UCSF competes with Stanford and Harvard for the highest quality candidates for positions, but those institutions can offer more money. It was noted that the medical schools are run more like corporations than academic institutions. UCSF's Chief Diversity Officer is primarily involved with students, not faculty.

¹ <https://senate.universityofcalifornia.edu/files/reports/rm-mb-divchairs-use-of-dei-statements.pdf>

UC Merced: The UC Merced Chief Diversity Officer was recently hired and is in the process of developing the office, which is anticipated to be a central hub for equity, diversity, and inclusion on the campus. It will oversee the Faculty Equity Advisor program and a comparable program for administrators. The local committee is helping to acclimatize the new CDO, and advocating for the implementation of UCAADE's recommendations for FEAs. The committee has encountered some resistance around the nominations of FEAs, and is working on processes and documentation. The Advisors are identified by the Executive Committee (composed of members from each school) and appointed by the local committee (following UCAADE recommendations). FEAs receive a stipend of \$5,000 per year. The local committee will discuss accountability for schools and departments that are repeatedly not hiring or even interviewing URM.

UC Irvine: UC Irvine's Chief Diversity Officer is Doug Haynes, the Vice Chancellor for Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion. He was previously the Vice Provost for EDI. The office's broad portfolio includes the medical school, oversight of the EA program and the ADVANCE program that provides research support funding, and is also home to the Chancellor's Fellowship Program. The CDO jointly oversees the DECADE program along with the VC for Graduate Studies, and UCI's role as a minority-serving institution (HSI, AANAPISI). The office manages Chancellor initiatives such as understanding and confronting extremism and confronting domestic terrorism, and student-led peace-building models. It allocates small grants and engages in a range of other activities including an inclusive excellence academy, forums, awards, and funding for dependent care travel.

The local committee is discussing DEI statements and has invited the CAP chair to the next meeting to talk about how the statements are used by CAP. There will be a review of UCI's FEA program – the first since its initiation.

UCSB: UC Santa Barbara is searching for new Vice Chancellor for DEI and the local committee is providing input. The campus lacks an organizational center for DEI activities. UCSB's Faculty Equity Advisor program was established in July 2019. Advisors are ladder-rank faculty appointed by deans and designated as "Associate Dean and Faculty Equity Advisor." Their exact roles and duties are still being determined, with input from the local committee, but the first priority is working with search committees. The local committee is also working with the chair of CAP on crafting uniform guidance for DEI statements. UCSB does not require diversity statements for review and promotion. Another local issue is a movement to take away priority registration for honors students.

UC Berkeley: UC Berkeley's Chief Diversity Officer is Oscar Dubón, Vice Chancellor for Equity & Inclusion. The office manages campus initiatives, committees, and task forces, as well as programs and services like the Faculty Equity Advisor program. The FEA program is very faculty-focused and FEAs are in each department. There are also associate deans of diversity or diversity & outreach in each of the divisions who are involved in admissions and hiring. Berkeley has a Task Force on becoming a designated Hispanic-Serving Institution. Many at Berkeley seem to be resistant to DEI statements.

UCLA: UCLA's Vice Chancellor for Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion (EDI) is Jerry Kang. The office was set up by Chancellor Block in 2014 and serves as a resource hub, including providing guidance for the evaluation of EDI statements. At UCLA, the deans decide whether to require the statements and determine how they are used. The statement can be a stand-alone document or part of a personal statement. Equity Advisors are appointed by the Vice Chancellor in conjunction with deans, and they work with deans and a council of equity advisors. There is an extensive list of expectations for the advisors, who receive an annual

stipend of \$6,000 and are provided with an additional \$4,000 budget for activities. UCLA's local committee is discussing the Equity Advisor program and how the information in EDI statements are used for departmental review. Equity Advisors participate in meetings of the local committee, and a representative from the Vice Chancellor's office joins the committee as well, although the interactions could be greater.

Riverside: UC Riverside's Chief Diversity Officer is an Associate Vice Chancellor with a relatively small office that serves as a resource hub, runs the equity advisor program, and offers seminars for faculty search committee members. The local committee has offered its assistance to advocate for support for additional resources for the office. Riverside's faculty equity advisor program began about two years ago and its effectiveness seems to depend on the individual college. The advisors are tasked with helping search committees to identify and encourage best practices for faculty recruitment and retention, and seem to be focusing on approving search committee lists. In the medical school, the advisors also provide support resources. There is a feeling that more accountability is needed.

UCSD: UC San Diego's Chief Diversity Officer is the Associate Vice Chancellor for Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion. CDO Becky Pettit was hired in 2015 and is now undergoing a five-year review that is overseen by an advisory committee composed of a representational group of faculty, staff and administrators. There is some cynicism about the work of the EDI office, partially due to frustrations over accountability and survey results that are not released to faculty. The work of the local committee generally involves responding to campus requests, although some members would like to see the committee have a role in larger, structural change. The committee is currently looking at bullying rules and guidelines, and providing faculty awards for work in diversity. The committee uses a defined criteria and ranking system to determine who qualifies for the awards and sends the list to the EVC for funding.

UCSC: Approximately 20% of UC Santa Cruz faculty are involved in local or systemwide Senate committees at any given time. The local committee is concerned about faculty from underrepresented groups being tapped for disproportionate amounts of service, and, since younger faculty are advised not to participate in committee service until later in their careers, the lack of representation from younger and more diverse faculty on Senate committees. The local committee is also discussing a joint Senate Diversity Fellowship with the Committee on Committees. The campus website on diversity is being evaluated for how it could be more effectively used. A "diversity landscape" document created last year compiled a long list of campus-sponsored diversity-related activities. The Chief Diversity Officer position was previously split into two, but is now a single position.

UC Davis: UC Davis' local committee has been talking about the backlash against DEI statements that have appeared in various news outlets, and whether there is a need to develop a defense strategy or response. The committee will support the eight new faculty members hired through the AFD pilot. The Vice Chancellor for Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion is a new position that was created just a few months ago. Renetta Tull was hired after a national search and will serve as the Chief Diversity Officer. The medical school also has an Associate Vice Chancellor of Equity and Inclusion. The campus awards a Chancellor's fellowship award for diversity to four faculty members who will receive a stipend of \$5,000 each.

Students: A primary focus of student groups on the campuses continues to be mental health and ensuring affordable and available care.

7. Systemwide Review Items

<https://senate.universityofcalifornia.edu/under-review/>

The committee will not send comments on any systemwide review items at this time.

Meeting participants: Mona Lynch (Chair), Javier Arsuaga (Vice Chair), Susan Schweik (Berkeley), Jose Torres (Davis), Louis DeSipio (Irvine), José Luiz Passos (Los Angeles, via video), Asmeret Berhe (Merced), Xuan Liu (Riverside), Michael Trigilio (San Diego), Errol Lobo (San Francisco), Melissa Morgan Consoli (Santa Barbara), Elizabeth Abrams (Santa Cruz), Natalie Lopez (Undergraduate Student Representative, UC San Diego, via video), Mark Lawson (PPFP Executive Director), Joanne Miller (Committee Analyst)

Meeting adjourned: 4:00

Meeting minutes drafted by: Joanne Miller, UCAADE Committee Analyst

Attest: Mona Lynch, UCAADE Chair