

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA **ACADEMIC SENATE**
UNIVERSITY COMMITTEE ON AFFIRMATIVE ACTION, DIVERSITY,
AND EQUITY

Draft Minutes of Meeting – January 14, 2021

Present: Javier Arsuaga (Chair, Davis); Daniel Widener (Vice Chair, San Diego); Julianna Deardorff (Berkeley); Jose Torres (Davis); Luis DiSipio (Irvine); Richard Yarborough (Los Angeles); Jesus Sandoval-Hernandez (Merced); Xuan Liu (Riverside); Melissa Morgan Consoli (Santa Barbara), Sylvanna Falcon (Santa Cruz); Andreea Seritan (San Francisco); Jennifer Burney (San Diego); Doreen Joseph (Graduate Student Davis); Susan Carlson (Vice Provost, Academic Personnel and Programs); Patricia Osorio O’Dea (Director of Academic Program Coordination); and Stefani Leto (Analyst)

I. Chair’s Announcements

- Chair Arsuaga introduced and welcomed Doreen Joseph as the graduate student representative to the committee.
- Committee members shared their reactions to the storming of the U.S. Capitol and political unrest. Several noted opportunities to support struggling students and to counter misinformation.

II. Consent Items

- The committee approved the minutes of the October 8, 2020 meeting.
- Chair Arsuaga asked that committee members approve the joint UCAADE-UCFW memo¹ recommending various responses to COVID-19 impacts on faculty members.

ACTION: UCAADE approved the joint UCFW memo

III. Consultation with UCFW Chair Shelley Halpain

- Chair Halpain provided an overview of UCFW’s purview. The committee discusses faculty pay and benefits, and two task forces report to UCFW: the Health Care Task Force and the Task Force on Investment and Retirement. Overlapping areas of interest create opportunities for ongoing collaboration between UCFW and UCAADE.
- Housing accessibility and affordability are concerns for UCFW. Last year, the committee sent a letter to Council urging additional efforts to help low-income faculty and staff afford to buy a home close to campus
- UCFW wants the University to track faculty demographics with greater precision and improve the systemwide integration of campus-level data. UCFW would like to work with UCAADE to advance this tracking.
- The joint UCFW-UCAADE memo recommending strategies for mitigating COVID-19 effects on faculty may present campuses with unfunded mandates for remedies such as teaching relief. Vice Provost Carlson will provide UCFW feedback on the memo.

¹ <https://senate.universityofcalifornia.edu/files/reports/mg-md-mitigating-covid-impacts-on-faculty.pdf>

- UCAADE members expressed support for systemwide equity reviews of salary by gender, while noting that top-down direction would be necessary for such an effort. A full equity evaluation will require workload audits and data on gender representation by step in addition to salary data.
- Salary differentials by discipline affect pay equity, given that fields with fewer women and minority faculty, such as STEM, tend to have higher salaries relative to other fields. Vice Chair Widener noted that the market will continue to drive inequitable faculty compensation. He requested additional committee discussion of pay scales, efforts to modernize the scales, specific approaches to the clinical salary scales, and strategies for attracting top talent while maintaining a focus on salary equity.

IV. Senate Leadership Update

- **Mary Gauvain, Academic Senate Chair**
- **Robert Horwitz, Academic Senate Vice Chair**

Regents Meeting. At the January Regents meeting, President Drake will convey his views on the Feasibility Study Working Group’s final report and recommendations concerning a possible test to replace the SAT/ACT.

Human Resources Reorganization. Associate Vice President Lloyd spoke to the UCFW Health Care Task Force in December regarding the reorganization of the Human Resources Department at the Office of the President in ways that provide clarity around benefits and support attracting and retaining top faculty. AVP Lloyd indicated that the reorganization includes having a dedicated staff member in person on campuses to provide information about benefits and retirement.

Remote Instruction. Chair Gauvain noted that all campuses will continue remote instruction through the academic year. She expressed appreciation for the UCAADE-UCFW letter on COVID impacts because it puts important considerations before President Drake.

Budget Updates. The Governor’s preliminary budget, released in the past week, will be finalized in May. President Drake plans to lobby for a full restoration of last year’s \$300 million cut to the University budget.

Campus Safety. President Drake announced two upcoming symposia on campus safety and policing. The first meeting in February will raise issues to be discussed at campuses and brought to a second meeting in March, where plans will be made to address the problems. Chair Gauvain notes that the University lacks good campus safety incident data and needs clarity around which data to collect.

Mentoring. Vice Chair Horowitz updated the committee on the efforts to add “mentoring” to APM 210.1.d (Criteria for Appointment, Promotion, and Appraisal—“Teaching”). He noted that Vice Provost Carlson has asked UCAP and CCGA to answer some questions about this effort, and suggested that UCAADE get involved, since underrepresented faculty are deeply involved in mentoring as part of their teaching.

Climate Change Initiatives. At the last meeting of UC’s Global Climate Leadership Council, proponents of UC San Diego’s “Green New Deal” asked the University to invest in planning to electrify the campuses, change UC’s focus from carbon neutrality to fossil free, and provide consistent data on fossil fuel emissions from each campus.

- Members discussed different levels of clarity around COVID vaccine tiers. Some confusion remains around Agriculture and Natural Resources and the National Labs’ place in the eligibility tiers.
- It was noted that UC’s non-police safety and security providers, such as Resident Assistants, generate more complaints than police on campuses. Individuals representing these providers, as well as those from student mental health services, will be part of the safety symposium. Ideally the symposium will develop best practices for all levels of campus safety and be attuned to differences between campuses and their varying needs.
- It was noted that campuses can support the Global Climate Leadership Council with activities like the letter urging the use of Environmental, Social, and Governance (ESG) standards when evaluating insurance carriers for the University, now making its way through the Senate. Faculty practices such as limiting air travel are green practices that can continue to good effect after the pandemic.

V. Discussion of the UCAF memo regarding the use of DEI statements in hiring

UCAADE reviewed a 2020 memo from UCAF to the Chair of the Academic Senate on the requirement of diversity, equity, and inclusion (DEI) statements for applicants to faculty positions. UCAADE members shared their experiences with DEI statements. The UCAF memo addresses rubrics to score applicants’ contributions to and stance toward diversity, equity, and inclusion, and UCAADE members noted varied impacts of rubrics on their campuses. Some campuses use statements as a separate area of evaluation, on par with teaching, research, and service, and some evaluate DEI work within the three areas of evaluation. Some members noted positive impacts of DEI statements on hiring pools’ diversity. Committee members expressed concern about using diversity scores for promotion, but supported their use in hiring. A footnote in the UCFW memo, that “DEI statements should be invited, *not required*” garnered concern, as it appears to undercut the serious use of DEI statements.

VI. Consultation with UCOP Office of Academic Personnel and Programs

- **Susan Carlson, Vice Provost for Academic Personnel**

Faculty Equity Advisors. Vice Provost Carlson noted that a meeting of campus Faculty Equity Advisors (FEAs) planned for last June and did not take place and has not yet been rescheduled. UCOP is planning a set of targeted Zoom sessions instead. After the pandemic changed hiring patterns drastically, FEAs who had focused primarily on hiring may need to rethink their roles in the short term.

- It was noted that UC Santa Cruz does not have an FEA program, although there is a Vice Provost for Equity. Deans at Santa Cruz are active and engaged with DEI issues, but faculty want both faculty and administration to work on the issues. Vice Provost Carlson

noted that other campuses experienced organizational challenges when they launched FEA programs.

UCFW/UCAADE Letter on COVID-19 Impacts on Faculty. Vice Provost Carlson noted that the letter was well-framed and is likely to be useful to campuses. Pandemic issues mean that some faculty may still perform high-quality work, but reduce their volume of work. The definition of excellence in the APM is still very restricted. The letter's impact on this kind of conversation appears helpful. The UC Office of the President may use the document to help prioritize requests for proposals in the next round of Advancing Faculty Diversity awards.

Faculty Equity Advisors. Vice Provost Carlson noted that a meeting of campus Faculty Equity Advisors (FEAs) planned for last June and did not take place and has not yet been rescheduled. UCOP is planning a set of targeted Zoom sessions instead. After the pandemic changed hiring patterns drastically, FEAs who had focused primarily on hiring may need to rethink their roles.

- It was noted that UC Santa Cruz does not have an FEA program, and a single Vice Provost for Equity is responsible for all faculty equity compliance and concerns. Deans at Santa Cruz are active and engaged with DEI issues, but faculty want both faculty and administration to work on the issues. Vice Provost Carlson noted that other campuses experienced similar challenges when they launched FEA programs.

UCFW/UCAADE Letter on COVID-19 Impacts on Faculty. Vice Provost Carlson noted that the letter was well-framed and is likely to be useful to campuses. Pandemic issues mean that some faculty may still perform high-quality work, but reduce their volume of work. The definition of excellence in the APM is still very restricted. The letter's impact on this kind of conversation appears helpful. The UC Office of Diversity and Equity may use the document to help prioritize requests for proposals in the next round of Advancing Faculty Diversity awards.

VII. Update on Faculty Equity Advisors on Campus

Committee members reported on their campus FEA programs. They solicited suggestions from Vice Provost Carlson.

- UC Berkeley's FEA program is primarily run through the Office of Faculty Equity and Welfare (OFEW), which allows for broad cross-campus organization. The OFEW originally focused on hiring and graduate student equity issues, but its mandate has broadened, and many issues now come to the FEAs. The OFEW is clarifying the FEAs' scope by centralizing handling of some complaints and issues.
- Irvine has the oldest FEA program in the UC system. The first evaluation of the program began last year. Evaluators solicited multiple perspectives, including surveying faculty. FEAs are involved in many equity decisions on campus, and they are independent of deans, although some schools have now appointed Associate Deans for Equity and Inclusion. Some activities formerly performed by FEAs are now the purview of the deans. This overlap is producing some confusion.
- At UCLA, deans have flexibility to identify FEA candidates. The FEAs report to the dean, but consult with the Vice Chancellor for Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion. The

Committee on Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (CODEI) plans to meet with as many of the 23 campus FEAs as possible to discuss the effectiveness of this decentralized approach.

- At UC Merced, the FEA's role is limited to the hiring process. The Committee for Diversity and Equity wants to clarify the process for evaluating FEAs to help ensure effective assessments. UC Merced has approved a new Administrative Equity Officer position shared with UC Santa Cruz, who will provide equity assessment for hiring of top administrators.
- UC Riverside's FEA program varies widely across departments, as leadership is decentralized and led by deans.
- At Santa Barbara, the FEA program is in its second year. FEAs are designated as Associate Deans, and there may be multiple pulls on their attention and issue focus.
- UC Santa Cruz's Committee on Committees (COC) would like deans to consult with them regarding appointees for FEA positions.
- Vice Provost Carlson suggested that a system-wide meeting of FEAs could address some campus issues, and that the role of the FEA may always be changeable. She cautioned that increasing responsibilities of the FEAs may discourage faculty from serving.
- Committee members expressed support for clearly defining the FEA role in the systemwide APM. On some campuses, deans determine the issues to which FEAs respond, and defining FEAs' roles would eliminate "mission creep," while also allowing for more effective evaluation of FEAs.
- Several committee members expressed concern about whether FEAs are being appropriately trained and whether training is universal across and within campuses.

Action: The committee will draft a document endorsing FEAs for campuses which do not currently have FEAs, as well as urging defined focus for the FEAs' mission.

VIII. Update on Joint Letter with UCFW on Mitigating COVID Impacts on Faculty

- It was noted that once approved by the Academic Council, the joint letter will be forwarded to President Drake. The letter highlights the variety of circumstances facing faculty and helps remind evaluators that not all faculty work under the same circumstances.
- UCAADE members agreed to identify ideas from the letter to implement on their campus, working through campus committees and administration, and provide feedback to UCAADE.
- Vice Provost Carlson suggested that Advancing Faculty Diversity awards can be used to address concerns that the proposals may be seen as unfunded mandates. Pandemic-related hiring slowdowns will allow FEAs to focus energy on other areas, such as recruitment and climate, so this letter can be used to prioritize and structure such efforts.
- Committee members' efforts to promote ideas from the letter are key to increasing their acceptance. If pushback comes on campus, that information can be used to identify areas for additional exploration.
- Additional joint projects may arise, including working with UCAP on the proposed addition of mentoring to teaching evaluation.

IX. Campus Updates

UC Berkeley is beginning to analyze data from the campus climate survey, and the Chair of the campus Academic Senate has released a formal statement concerning the use of DEI statements in promotions. The campus has hired a director for the Division of Equity and Inclusion.

UC Davis recently awarded four \$5000 Chancellor's Fellowships for Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion to Academic Senate members, and secured another award for Academic Federation members. The Senate diversity committee met with individuals working on campus DEI issues, campus policing, the climate crisis, student mental health services, and the use of DEI statements in merit and promotions.

The UCLA diversity committee is discussing the impact of COVID on faculty and the wider campus community, the use of diversity statements, campus policing, the role of FEAs, and student concerns about offensive language in classes. The committee formed an ad hoc committee to evaluate recommendations for combatting campus racism outlined in the Moreno Report several years ago. Finally, the committee has found that units provide inconsistent data units in self-reviews, which makes program evaluation difficult.

UC Irvine's Committee on Affirmative Action and Diversity issued a survey to faculty about FEAs, and is monitoring diversity in undergraduate admissions investigating reasons for the recent decline in Latino applications. The committee is also concerned about the retention of students struggling with pandemic-related issues, support for graduate students, and community policing.

UC Merced is working with multiple campus committees on anti-racism initiatives and seeking input from a diverse range of stakeholders, especially Black faculty. The Merced faculty are less diverse than the students they teach.

The UC Riverside committee is addressing salary equity issues and gathering a list of responses to COVID pressures on faculty, such as teaching releases and other accommodations.

The UC San Diego Committee on Academic Personnel (CAP) recently asked faculty to provide COVID impact statements and is working with the Black Student Union to elevate and respond to their concerns.

The UCSF diversity committee has created rubrics for documenting COVID-related faculty efforts in place of research and teaching they would have done without the pandemic. FEAs at UCSF are charged only with evaluating initial appointments.

The UC Santa Barbara committee is evaluating nominations for a new Faculty Diversity Award. The committee plans to investigate faculty workloads as a long-term project.

UC Santa Cruz is still feeling the effects of last year's graduate student wildcat strikes; efforts to heal relationships are ongoing. CAAD is discussing policies around faculty recruitment waivers, campus autonomy over approaches to policing, and is also creating a robust FEA program. The Office of Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion now reports directly to the Chancellor, which will help elevate the importance of DEI issues.

X. Items Under Systemwide Review

The Committee endorsed a letter from UCOLASC opposing budget cuts to the California Digital Library, CDL.

Chair Arsuaga will summarize items under review and request feedback by email.

The meeting adjourned at 3:42 p.m.

Minutes Prepared by Stefani Leto, Principal Committee Analyst

Attest: Javier Arsuaga, UCAADE Chair