

UNIVERSITY COMMITTEE ON AFFIRMATIVE ACTION, DIVERSITY, AND EQUITY
(UCAADE)

Thursday, April 21, 2016

Members present:	Colleen Clancy (Chair), Amani Nuru-Jeter (Vice Chair), Tanya Golash-Boza, Belinda Robnett-Olsen, Beth Schneider, Lok Siu, Janice Tsoh (for Audrey Lyndon)
Via phone:	Miriam Greenberg, Manuela Martins-Green, Daniel Widener
Members absent:	Russell Thornton, Sean Owens
Consultants and Guests:	Dan Hare (Academic Senate Chair), Jim Chalfant (Academic Senate Vice Chair), Susan Carlson (Vice Provost, Academic Personnel and Programs), Yvette Gullatt (Vice Provost and Chief Outreach Officer), Amy K. Lee (Diversity, Labor and Employee Relations Director), Karie Frasch, (Director of UC Berkeley's Office for Faculty Equity and Welfare), Joanne Miller (Committee Analyst)

Meeting Minutes**I. Chair's Report** – *Chair Colleen Clancy*

- Welcome, agenda review, and approval of agenda
- Announcements
- Approval of Jan. 25, 2016, meeting minutes

Jan. 25, 2016, meeting minutes were **approved**.

UCAADE Chair Colleen Clancy proposed that the June 16th meeting be held via videoconference (with teleconference option) instead of in-person. Timing will be approximately 9:00 to noon or 1:00pm, depending on the extent of the agenda items. Committee analyst Joanne Miller will set up time for a test of the Zoom video system in advance of the meeting. Chair Clancy said that Zoom had been working very well for Academic Council meetings.

Chair's Announcements:

New Retirement Plan: The Regents approved the new retirement plan presented by President Napolitano. The plan affects new employees hired after July 1, 2016. It has a cap on pension, but tries to mitigate the negative impact of that with a defined contribution (DC) supplement. There is also a DC-only option available. The long-term effects of the new retirement tier remain to be seen; if it results in more faculty departures, it could end up being more costly for the University. UCAADE members noted the increased need for advisory services to explain the choices in the new plan. UCSB is discussing this. Housing costs are a major issue for faculty. Committee member Miriam Greenberg said that she is involved in a housing study in Santa Cruz. Is this an item for UCAADE to pursue? It's an issue that the Faculty Welfare committees discuss regularly. UCAADE can reach out to UCFW; this committee's interest is the impact on ethnic and class diversity.

For a future meeting: Invite someone from Office of Loan Programs to talk about UC's housing assistance programs.

State audit: The State of California’s Auditor’s Report was released March 29. [[Fact Sheet](#); [Summary](#); [Full Report](#); [Hearing](#).] The main issue of concern is whether nonresidents are pushing out California residents, and whether the out of state students are of equal quality. The report suggested that the admitted nonresident students were less qualified than California residents and did not bring diversity to the university.

Academic Council: Academic Council discussed the “Search Waivers Guiding Principles” document and members recommended that more explicit language around contributions to diversity be added to the guidelines for Targets of Excellence.

II. Subcommittee break-out sessions

Before dividing into groups, the committee briefly discussed faculty salary equity analyses. The university is finalizing this year’s salary plan for faculty, which will again provide a 1.5% increase to the general salary scales and allow chancellors to use 1.5% to address the four identified issues of equity, inversion, compression, and exceptional merit.

UCSB now has an expert in salary equity who recommended to the local Committee on Diversity and Equity that they urge the EVC do the salary equity analysis again using Berkeley’s parameters.

For its work, UCAADE will extract information from the campus reports, evaluate the results, and recommend standards or a common set of parameters for campuses to use. Increased uniformity will allow easier comparison between campuses. After analyzing the studies and results, UCAADE will prepare a report for the Provost to send to campuses.

The committee divided into two groups:

1. **Faculty salary equity analysis:** Clancy, Greenberg, Martins-Green, Siu, and Tsoh (for Lyndon).
2. **Anti-discrimination policies:** Neru-Jeter, Golash-Boza, Robnett-Olsen, and Schneider.

III. Consultation with Academic Senate Leadership

Dan Hare, Academic Council Chair

Jim Chalfant, Academic Council Vice Chair

Update from the last Regents Meeting:

President Napolitano’s [Retirement Options](#) proposal was approved at the last Regents’ meeting. The final plan was a better deal than the options proposed by the Retirement Options Task Force, although the plan differs slightly in benefits offered to faculty and staff. (The difference is whether the DC supplement starts on the first dollar earned.) Some in state government would have preferred if UC had just adopted the PEPRA cap without any additional compensation. The next step will be implementation.

The Regents’ [Statement Against Intolerance](#) was also passed. The final version included an amendment that was suggested by the University Committee on Academic Freedom (UCAAF). Academic Council Chair Hare sent the proposed amendment, which helped to distinguish anti-Zionism from anti-Semitism, to the work group in advance of the full committee meeting, giving the members a chance to consider the wording change. Chair Hare noted the value of “working behind the scenes” for productive and congenial outcomes.

More updates:

Twenty-one “transfer pathways” to ease the transition from community college to UC have been completed and are available on a new website

(<http://admission.universityofcalifornia.edu/transfer/preparation-paths/>). Next steps are to examine articulation gaps and fill in more majors.

College Level Examination Program (CLEP) exams, which some colleges and universities use for alternative credits, are being examined by subject matter experts on the campuses to see if they are suitable for UC adoption. However, there has been a glitch in the process as the College Board will not allow UC faculty look at the exams without a College Board representative in the room. The College Board is sponsoring a bill to make all colleges give the same credit for AP exams.

Academic Senate Vice Chair Jim Chalfant will be stepping down from the UC's Retirement System advisory board as he assumes the Chair in the fall. The UCRS board is accepting nominations to fill the last two years of Jim's term. The election will be in May.

The recently released State [Audit Report](#) focused on admittance of non-California residents. It seems to accuse BOARS of lowering admissions standards when it adopted "compare favorably" standards (in 2011). The auditor wants UC to find additional fund by "saving money," redirecting set-asides for non-instructional programs directly to undergraduate education, and becoming more aggressive in imposing Working Smarter cost savings. The report says UC was too quick to abandon furloughs, and should enroll more students without providing faculty salary increases. Chair Hare noted that UC's State Government Relations office did a fantastic job in the rebuttal report and working with state legislators before the report hearing. There will be faculty op-ed pieces soon.

President Napolitano has requested more information from the Joint Committee on Faculty Discipline. The Committee's [Report](#) found that disciplinary policies are in place but that more information, education, and communication is needed on campuses. It also recommended a few minor changes to the APM. Much of the sexual harassment news has come out since the report was released. Two key pieces of information that the Joint Committee found were that data is not kept very well and that early or alternate discipline measures are used rather than faculty discipline procedures.

Discussion: Committee members mentioned UCAADE's concerns around housing and UC's MOP (mortgage origination program). Chair Hare said that the program was altered based on Dodd-Frank legislation reforms. As a result it is not as good a deal as it used to be, although it still provides faculty with a lower-than-market interest rate. Although the MOP guidelines say that loans are 30-year, chancellors can use discretion to approve 40-year loans. This is an issue for Faculty Welfare, although UCAADE has interest in all aspects of the compensation system that might perpetuate inequities. There is an annual report from MOP that goes to the Regents in November.

IV. Working Lunch with Provost Aimée Dorr

Discussion centered on the proposed Guiding Principles for Search Waivers and UCAADE's suggested best practices for the President's Postdoctoral Fellows Program. Provost Dorr is working on her response letter to UCAADE. Her office sees the data presented in UCAADE's document differently. There seemed to be consensus, however, that the ideas embodied in the two documents could be aligned. The perception is that campuses would like more guidance on when to apply search waivers; the question is how best to accomplish that without impinging on campus autonomy. Part of the motivation behind the Principles is to allow UC Recruit to collect data.

The faculty hiring recommendations at the end of UCAADE's document used the term "Early Career Target of Excellence," with examples, to illustrate who should be considered for a search waiver. Early

and mid-career Targets of Excellence could be more regularly applied. Departments could also make better use of existing retention or promotion tools to catch folks before they take off for other institutions.

The comments from the Senate's review of the Guiding Principles asked for clarity about whether the Principles should be considered as policy or best practices. Comments from campus administration are still coming in.

Provost Dorr noted that Presidential Fellows are not always hired via search waivers, and that a closed selective process can have a negative impact on the candidate as well as bring suspicion from outside observers. It can be in everyone's best interest to show that the person hired did "win" the position. Search waivers are a small percentage of total hires and will not have a big impact on diversifying the faculty. Faculty have to commit to making their departments more diverse. Wide agreement and commitment to action seems to be the key. UCAADE has previously discussed the issues around search committee constitution and diversity.

Chair Clancy said that UCAADE's document, the product of an Academic Senate committee, is meant to address the fact that the UC faculty has become less diverse. Despite the existence of campus administrators who focus on diversity, it can still be very difficult to hire underrepresented minorities and women within the existing hiring structures. Search waivers are one tool to get the best diverse people, even if it circumvents search process. In order to address campus climate issues and create a more inclusive environment, the university needs more underrepresented minorities in faculty positions and for various reasons the traditional hiring process is not making that happen. The length of the hiring process at UC also impacts the ability to hire and retain diverse, high quality candidates.

Vice Provost Susan Carlson's office will work on revising the Search Waivers Guiding Principles document based on Senate and campus responses.

UCAADE will continue to advocate for incentives for hiring underrepresented minorities and contributions to the diversity of the faculty. One idea was a presidential endowed chair tied to diversity.

V. Consultation with UCOP - Academic Personnel and Programs

Susan Carlson, Vice Provost, Academic Personnel and Programs

Amy K. Lee, Diversity, Labor and Employee Relations Director

Vice Provost Carlson and Director Amy Lee discussed the use of search waivers, and the notion of making search waivers available more generally (not just for PFP) for cases where potential candidates bring excellence in scholarship and unique contribution to diversity.

The rules for open search exceptions are not always clear to the campuses. UCSB has had several waiver requests, but not for diversity purposes. Records or data on the reasons that waivers were applied would be helpful.

UCSC currently has an effort underway to document the Target of Excellence program on campus to see who was being hired, and how it impacted overall numbers. Early results show a detrimental effect on diversity.

Presidential Postdoctoral Fellows have already been vetted just by virtue of being in the program. There's nothing to prevent recruiting quality candidates, but campuses need clarity on how it can be done.

Some departments will have to take risks to get to a "critical mass," of diversity to get to an improved campus and departmental climate.

There have been some studies that show the benefits of cluster hires to diversifying the workplace. President Napolitano should incentivize minority hiring (and cluster hiring if that's what it takes). There is no University that is doing a good job at hiring and retaining under-represented minorities, but that shouldn't stop UC from trying. UC can model good practices.

VP Carlson gave a brief update on the NSF grant on recruiting STEM faculty that was just titled "Evaluating Equity in Faculty Recruitment." It is intended as a "systematic analysis of the faculty hiring process at Research Intensive Universities" and will use data from UC Recruit, which is the best data set that exists on faculty recruitment. Researchers from Davis and Berkeley are leading the study. The researchers will be able to use data from two years of CVs, as well as position descriptions, departmental composition, search committee composition, and more, and will relate those factors to the outcome. The advisory board will meet in May, with Christina Ravelo from Santa Cruz serving as the Academic Senate representative. **Action:** UCAADE will invite the study's co-PIs to give an update in the fall.

UCAADE member Sean Owens will go to the faculty exit survey roundtable in June at UC Irvine. There is a large pool of data, and experienced researchers are participating. A team from Harvard will come to talk about data and a faculty member from Maryland to talk about how to build inclusive departments. There will be panels from campuses that have been doing their own exit surveys. Preliminary data from the survey will be made available. While the current survey is a pilot, VP Carlson's office is hoping that campuses will keep funding it.

Action: The committee analyst will find out if one of the Harvard researchers could participate in UCAADE's June meeting.

VI. Consultation with UCOP - Diversity & Engagement

Yvette Gullatt, Vice Provost and Chief Outreach Officer

Vice Provost Gullatt talked about the responsibilities of her office, explaining the shared accountability system at UC. She clarified her role as the Chief Outreach Officer, not the University's Chief Diversity Officer, which means she provides education and training, and works on issues related to the K-12 and community college pipeline. The work of her office includes graduate student diversity. VP Gullatt noted that a few of President Napolitano's [initiatives](#) focus on diversity issues, which helps to bring attention (and funding). The May Regents meeting will include a review of a sub-report of the Accountability Report showing progress in certain area, but not all. UC is not doing well in increasing the numbers of African American students or faculty, or in career advancement of Asians and Latinos into senior management positions. African American faculty remains constant at 2.7%.

Accountability and responsibility for diversity on the campuses resides with the chancellors, deans, and department chairs. Everyone has to work within existing structures that may impact faculty diversity. Programs like PFP and UC-HBCU are seen to work well, but they are relatively small. Clarity about existing programs and more incentives are needed; deans and chairs need to know what they can do and what is expected. Departments that make an effort are generally successful at diversifying, but sometimes more pressure at the department level is needed.

VP Gullatt noted that campuses vary in the way they address student diversity. UC Berkeley has targeted recruitment efforts in Georgia. The group discussed the pipeline issue and the admittance and retention of students, particularly in the STEM fields. Recruiting from minority populations sometimes involves different approaches, such as including the family in the decision process.

VII. Guest from UC Berkeley: Karie Frasch, Director, UC Berkeley Office for Faculty Equity and Welfare

Karie Frasch, the Director of UC Berkeley's Office for Faculty Equity and Welfare, joined the UCAADE meeting to talk about the work of the systemwide EEO/AA directors' group and in her role as a member of the UC Recruit Governance Board.

UC's [Equal Employment Opportunity / Affirmative Action / Diversity Administrators](#) group has members from all campuses and OP. The membership comprises the diversity, sexual harassment, and Title IX officers. Some campuses have more than one person, while others have a single officer for academic and staff issues.

UCAADE members and Director Frasch talked about the Search Waiver Guiding Principles and UCAADE PFP documents. Frasch noted that in general, it's not a good idea to have "diversity" hires, as it can take away from a person's other qualifications.

The group discussed search committees, faculty equity advisors, and the possibilities for working with the existing hiring system. Berkeley has some recommendations around search plans, evaluations, and ranking of candidates. Campuses have different ways of using search committees.

Further discussion focused on search waivers, Targets of Excellence, spousal hires, and the potential negative impact on diversity. Again it was noted that search waivers should only be a small percentage of total hires. At Berkeley, less-diverse departments were identified in an analysis, informed of their inadequate hiring practices, and told to improve.

Frasch will share reports from her department. Berkeley is also collecting data to show best practices around hiring practices.

UCAADE should treat the systemwide EEO/AA group as a resource. The chairs will communicate at the beginning of the academic year to find possible topics.

VIII. Campus Reports, Next Steps, and Issue for Future Meetings

Local CAADs can work with EVC or other campus officials on promoting search waivers when appropriate. UCAADE should continue to have a close relationship with PFP director Mark Lawson. Lawson is working on bringing PFP to the health sciences campuses, including finding new money. There are generally 12-15 fellows per year, plus the Chancellor's fellows.

UCSF: The Committee on Equal Opportunity is co-sponsoring with the Office of Diversity & Outreach a presentation of the interactive live theater for Academic Senate committees. The committee is also collaborating with CAP on a Faculty Success Handbook, specifically on documenting contributions to diversity. Diversity resources are being considered for inclusion in orientation materials.

Merced & UCSF are starting Faculty Equity Advisor programs.

Action: A Faculty Equity Advisor update will be added to the next meeting agenda. There may be data on models from last year.

Meeting adjourned: 4:00

Notes prepared by: Joanne Miller, Committee Analyst

Attest: Colleen Clancy, UCAADE Chair