

UNIVERSITY COMMITTEE ON AFFIRMATIVE ACTION, DIVERSITY, AND EQUITY

Monday, January 25, 2016

Members present:	Colleen Clancy (Chair), Amani Nuru-Jeter (Vice Chair), Lok Siu, Sean Owens, Tanya Golash-Boza, Manuela Martins-Green, Daniel Widener, Audrey Lyndon
Via phone:	Beth Schneider, Belinda Robnett-Olsen
Absent:	Russell Thornton, Miriam Greenberg
Consultants and Guests:	Jim Chalfant (Academic Senate Vice Chair), Susan Carlson (Vice Provost, Academic Personnel and Programs), Karen Petrulakis (Chief Deputy General Council), Elisabeth Yap (Senior Council), Joanne Miller (Committee Analyst)

Minutes of Meeting**I. Chair's Report** – *Chair Colleen Clancy*

- Welcome and agenda review, announcements, approval of the agenda

Agenda approved.

UCAADE's PFP Best Practices Recommendations report will be presented at the Academic Council meeting on Weds.

At UC San Diego, an issue has come up regarding clarifying the impact of PFP hires on departmental hiring allocations. It may come up as an issue with the UCSD Academic Senate, and there may be a role for the Faculty Equity Advisors in this situation. The topic will be brought up with Vice Provost Susan Carlson later in the meeting.

II. Consultation with UCOP - Academic Personnel and Programs

Susan Carlson, Vice Provost

Background: President's Postdoctoral Fellows Program Initiative Report

- **President's Postdoctoral Fellows Program Initiative**

President Napolitano provided \$5 million in one-time funding for the Postdoctoral Fellows Program Initiative. Vice Provost Carlson hopes to somehow continue the work funded by the Initiative in future, especially the training, which was seen as very successful. But funding may not be forthcoming, due to budget reductions at UCOP. President Napolitano reviewed a version of the Report that included a detailed budget in December, and was supportive. As part of the initiative, every campus received a membership in the National Center for Faculty Development and Diversity (NCFDD), an online mentoring network. Each campus can continue its membership in NCFDD at a cost of \$16,000 per campus per year, but it might be necessary to help promote the effectiveness of the program.

Carlson's report can be circulated. It will be sent to campus Vice Chancellors for Equity and Inclusion.

Discussion: There was some concern that the hiring incentive packages offered to fellows have not been used. UCAADE would like to see the PFP program be open to all disciplines, including health sciences. All other schools offering PhD programs are already included.

Action: UCAADE can write a letter in support of including Health Science schools in the PFP. More data or information may be requested from Mark Lawson and Susan Carlson to inform the letter. Vice Provost Yvette Gullatt, who is convening the Equity and Inclusion Vice Chancellors, may be able to help frame a letter.

- **Online video training module adapted from the interactive theatre presentation in leadership seminar**

The diversity training presentations took time and resources to implement, but worked out very well. Attendees were primarily chairs and deans. While some might say the sessions were “preaching to the choir,” they received very positive feedback. The last two presentations were at UCSF and Berkeley and turnout was excellent. Attendees expressed appreciation for the interactive theater portion, which offered deeper engagement. UC Berkeley was a good test case since the deans and chairs were required to attend and did not self-select. VP Carlson’s office is following up with participants six to nine months later. Results will be reported in March. UCSD faculty member Emily Roxworthy is doing follow-up with departments, with costs funded by the departments/schools. At UCSF there was demand for more.

The theater presentation was videotaped, and there is a small group that includes UCAADE member Tanya Golash-Boza working on how to continue the work. The funding goes through April, so the group will need to finish by then. The feeling is that video is good, but a live person is needed to facilitate discussion. Some of the best parts of the live sessions were in the discussions afterward.

Discussion: If UCAADE writes a letter of support for continuing the training, Professor Roxworthy should be consulted.

The faculty equity advisor model would align nicely with this programing. Training could be provided, and the advisors could work with search committees. Training could be incorporated into departmental strategic plans and program review processes. In their meeting with President Napolitano, Chair Clancy and Vice Chair Nuru-Jeter asked for pressure “from the top” for diversity to be included in dean and chair reviews each year. Recommendations for diversity within hiring committees should be specific.

- **President’s Postdoctoral Fellows Program**

Whether or not FTE allocations via the PFP count against departmental allocation is a big deal, and ties into hiring incentive, which some departments may need more than others. Recommendations from UCAADE members include that faculty hired from PFP should not count against FTE allocation.

Discussion: The group touched on whether there should be more pilots for finding other ways to bring in post-docs. PFP has worked pretty well, but may be more ways to bring fellows. This year there were over 700 PFP applicants, which also means that almost 700 faculty are interesting in being a sponsor. The program has been seen as a way of diversifying faculty, but it could also be promoted as diversifying the post-doc population.

Other issues to think about include the amount of effort that goes into recruitment but then not into similar support or retention once a new faculty member is hired. UC falling behind in total remuneration is seen as negatively impacting minority hiring. It is very difficult to find comparable total remuneration data (by race/ethnicity and gender) from other academic institutions. While other considerations beside remuneration impact decision-making, thinking about the intersection of remuneration and diversity may

be beneficial at a time when the faculty's focus is on remuneration and the administration is interested in diversity.

On diversity hiring in general, committee members suggested that a systemwide searchable "diversity" list or resource page maintained by UCOP would be useful. Another suggestion was made to include mentoring activities in promotion and tenure considerations. (That's what APM 210-1.d is about.) This may be a topic for a joint meeting with UCAP.

- **Faculty Exit Survey**

A faculty exit survey is being piloted this year on six campuses. It will include questions about climate. The administration is also hoping to interview new hires who left other institutions to come to UC.

There is a systemwide seminar June 28 at Irvine that will focus on the results of the surveys. UCAADE members are invited. VP Carlson is hoping to have five representatives from each campus and attendees from other universities as well.

- **NSF Grant – Recruiting STEM Faculty: A Systemic Analysis of the Faculty Hiring Process at Research-Intensive Universities**

This project is being led by a PI at Davis; there are co-PIs from Berkeley, as well as VP Carlson. The intention is to figure out what interventions work in hiring a diverse faculty. The group has a large amount of hiring information, including the composition of search committees and how the make-up impacts eventual hire. The group will be invited to talk to UCAADE later on when there is something to report.

- **Search Waiver Guiding Principles**

Academic Personnel Directors (APDs) are preparing guidelines meant to bring consistency around search waivers. The document, stemming from audits by federal agencies, will include an explanation of why it was created. It will address when search waivers may or may not be appropriate. PFP has already been called out as appropriate. The document should be out to the Academic Senate within the next two weeks.

- **National Mentoring Resource Network (NRMN)**

A national NIH award created the National Mentoring Resource Network (NRMN). UC is not one of the main participants, but has a small \$25,000 sub-award to develop a "train-the-mentors" program, focusing on bio-medical fields. A group led by Dr. Mitchell Feldman at UCSF is working on an event to train trainers, make connections, and form networks.

- **Diversity at Regents' Meeting**

There will be an item on diversity at the March Regents' meeting. A report that includes students, staff, and faculty is being developed in Academic Affairs. Faculty diversity has been a big concern of student Regents.

- **Faculty salary equity analysis**

Discussion: The committee noted that different methodologies were used for the faculty salary equity analysis across campuses. UCAADE is interested in how remediation is being done for equity adjustment, and whether information can be provided. VP Carlson responded that, by Feb.1, every campus is

supposed to report to Provost Dorr on how they met the adjustment requirement. There will be a lot of information, but it can be reported to UCAADE. VP Carlson noted that campuses can choose how frequently to do faculty salary equity studies.

UCAADE is thinking of compiling “red-flags” from each campus study into a document for all to consider. The intention is to submit a document to Council in spring.

Action: Susan Carlson will forward an email message regarding the campus reports.

III. Consultation with Academic Senate Leadership

Jim Chalfant, Academic Council Vice Chair

Academic Council Vice Chair Chalfant reported on the recent Regents’ meeting and the work of the Academic Senate leadership. Right now, the Regents are focusing on time to degree, including transfer pathways, and are starting to understand the challenges the campuses will face in trying to absorb 10,000 new students. It might be a good time to think about how to make use of this opportunity to hire more diverse faculty.

Items coming up from the Regents and Academic Senate include:

- Report of a joint committee on faculty discipline.
- A statement from the Regents on intolerance that will be issued as policy.
- A potential policy on Openness in Research.
- A title change for “Lecturers with Security of Employment (SOE)”.

IV. Retirement Options Task Force Report to the President

Jim Chalfant, Academic Council Vice Chair

UCAADE Chair Colleen Clancy

The Report was released on January 15, 2016, for expedited systemwide review. Comments are due on February 5th.

Discussion: UCAADE members are concerned about the incorporation of a DC plan and the impact on new faculty hires, which may have more women and underrepresented minorities as a group than the existing employee pool. The unions will surely be against the plan, and about half of the UC workforce is represented by a bargaining unit.

Action: Committee member Golash-Boza will send her comments on the ROTF report to Chair Clancy, who will then draft a response letter from UCAADE. Committee members will have an opportunity via email to contribute to the response.

V. Chair Reports and Campus Reports

Chair Colleen Clancy; committee members

Chair: In their meeting with President Napolitano, Chair Clancy and Vice Chair Nuru-Jeter requested that systemwide/central funding be allocated for Faculty Equity Advisor program. It is important for the

advisors to be taken seriously by search committee members and chairs, and support from the top tiers of the administration would help.

Clancy has FEA data from all campuses. The committee is interested in best practices around the system.

Action (future): Invite people from campuses with FEA models to attend (or call in to) a UCAADE meeting for a discussion of the program.

Merced: The campus is incorporating diversity standards into program review as part of the official process (every 7 years, every academic program gets reviewed). A Faculty Equity Advisor program is starting. For now, the Diversity and Equity committee is leading the effort to implement a faculty-to-faculty training on why diversity is important, what it is, implicit bias, and more. A Merced representative went to Davis to learn about the UCD training.

Berkeley: The local committee received an update from the School of Social Welfare, which had a classroom harassment situation. A representative from Academic Personnel came to talk about how to deal with different types of harassment situations. The suggestion is to go ahead and inquire at the appropriate campus office (e.g., Title IX) and let it be known that harassment claims will have to be reported.

Davis: Davis holds an equity summit each year. This year the event features Pedro Noguera. UCAADE member Owens is on the planning committee. This year's summit is Tuesday, March 8, 2016, 4–9 p.m. Davis is also talking about systemic use of diversity statements for hiring faculty (e.g., for all of UC Davis job descriptions – similar to UCLA). Local CAAD is working on systemwide policy review and a campus strategic plan.

Davis connects the Faculty Equity Advisor program to their recruitment toolkit.

UCSF: The Chancellor is funding several initiatives, including a research award for underrepresented faculty. UCSF is planning additional interactive theater activities, and hope to have a broad faculty audience (for now, those serving on Academic Senate committees will get priority). The campus is subsidizing half of the cost of enrollment for the NCFDD boot camp. The local committee is working on faculty handbook revisions to reflect changes to 210.d and reviewing the definition of “groups” in diversity and inclusion.

Riverside: There is a new chancellor a lot of flux and change in administration, including a new position of Associate Vice Chancellor for Diversity and Inclusion. The local CAAD is considering ways to increase the diversity of the more than 100 new faculty/instructors that Riverside intends to hire.

Irvine: The Sexual Harassment policy was discussed at Faculty Welfare, particularly the mandatory reporting by graduate students. The local Senate also reviewed the UC Regents Statement on Intolerance. There was a police incident at faculty housing that may have had racial implications. In response, police came to the Faculty Welfare meeting. There were student protests last spring against a campus climate – and that of the surrounding community – that is seen as inhospitable to African Americans.

The local committee also discussed 1.5% salary equity funding and how it would be disbursed.

Discussion: UCAADE members expressed interested in being more involved in support and solidarity with Muslim community. (*Keep in mind for future agenda.*)

Action: Clancy will send info on FEA to Manuela Martins-Green and Tanya Golash-Boza.

V. Consultation with UCOP - Office of General Council

Karen Petrulakis, Chief Deputy General Council

Elisabeth Yap, Senior Counsel

- **Guidelines For Addressing Race and Gender Equity in Academic Programs in Compliance with Proposition 209**

[The OGC Prop. 209 guidelines](#) document was developed at behest of President Napolitano. The central themes are:

- Have a strong message from leadership that diversity is supported.
- Importance of a strategic plan, including how progress will be measured.
- A welcoming campus climate.

OGC wants to keep the document current. UCAADE can help by alerting OGC if there is anything missing.

Discussion: UCAADE recommended wide distribution of the guidelines, including sending to every search committee chair and Faculty Equity Advisor. The committee also suggested that a one-page summary would be useful in passing out al search committee members. Vice Provost Yvette Gullatt may be working on something along those lines. VP Gullatt's office may also be able to facilitate disseminating the guidelines to local offices for Equity and Inclusion.

VII. UCAADE ongoing priorities for 2015-16

Chair Colleen Clancy

Vice Chair Amani Nuru-Jeter

- **Anti-discrimination policies**

Nuru-Jeter's cursory review of UC's anti-discrimination policies revealed many policies covering many groups. UCAADE had originally talked about finding out whether there are significant loopholes in the policies. There are federal, state, and campus regulations and guidelines. One way that UCAADE may get involved would be in promoting standards for reporting or standards for disciplinary measures, rather than trying to standardize policies.

A current joint administration/faculty committee is going to address policies related to faculty discipline at UC at a very high-level, with a focus on consistencies/inconsistencies across campuses. Sheryl Vacca, Senior Vice President of Ethics, Compliance and Audit services is on that committee and has put together living document of current policies and bylaws. Nuru-Jeter has requested the latest version from Vacca's office.

Action: Invite Vice President Sheryl Vacca to a future UCAADE meeting to discuss the work of the joint committee. Inquire whether it would be possible to have data on all incidents that have to do with race that were actually crimes.

Action items for committee members:

1. Info gathering and memo writing in support of PFPF in Health Sciences. Talk to Mark Lawson about getting PFPF data. (Clancy & Lyndon)
2. Faculty salary equity analysis: going through reports from last year, pulling out relevant things, compiling together. (Clancy, Nuru-Jeter, Siu, Widener, Greenberg; Martins-Green in the loop)
3. Anti-discrimination policies: review for loopholes, potential recommendations for standards of reporting or disciplinary measures. (Nuru-Jeter, Owens, Robnett-Olsen, Thornton; Golash-Boza and Clancy in the loop)

Meeting adjourned at 4:00

Notes prepared by: Joanne Miller

Attest: Chair Colleen Clancy