

## COORDINATING COMMITTEE ON GRADUATE AFFAIRS

## Minutes of Meeting

Wednesday, November 6, 2013

10:00 a.m. – 4:00 p.m.

UCOP Main Building, 1111 Franklin Street, Oakland – Room 10325

**Audio Primary Dial-In: 1-866-740-1260 | Passcode: 9879466**<http://www.universityofcalifornia.edu/senate/>**I. Chair's Report/Announcements/Updates – Chair Donald Mastronarde**

- **October 18 Budget Call:** Chair Mastronarde shared highlights from budget call with CCGA including: the total re-numeration study for ladder-rank Senate faculty is underway with results expected by the end of the spring semester; UC budget submission will include requests for a separate state allocation for UCRS and a one percent budget increase for enrollment growth. The budget submission assumes no tuition hike nor increases in PDSTs. Other highlights mentioned were the substantial savings reported (\$100M) in refinancing university debt and interest payments which by law must be redirected to the retirement system.
- **October 23/31 Academic Council Meeting:** Chair Mastronarde summarized discussion items of particular interest to CCGA including: the long-awaited presentation to the Regents on support for graduate students at their November meeting; graduate student support will also be the focus of discussion at the Council of Chancellor's meeting; rethinking the current Master Plan; enrollment issues, consultation with the President on Moreno report; UC Care roll-out and lack of Senate consultation with Senate; dismay with the various options on the table regarding the composite benefits rate.
- **October 29 Academic Planning Council Meeting:** Chair Mastronarde reported on topics of interest to CCGA including: the SSGDP and PDST policy revisions and forthcoming Senate-wide review; appropriate and useful performance metrics for graduate education (normative time-to-degree and variation of how the policies are applied on the campuses; post-graduation employment; how other universities are responding to requests for metrics in their respective states); Presidential policy on open access; preview of campus long-range enrollment plans and concerns with the projected increase of non-resident undergraduates; omission of DOE figure for projected 2020-21 California high school graduates; and projections for graduate program enrollment by campus.
- **October 8 COGD Phone Meeting:** Prof. Valerie Leppert (UCM) reported on the COGD call in which the following topics were discussed: the upcoming private industry forum; long-term financial issues for graduate education; campus implementation of trainings required by Violence Against Women Act (March 2014); and the Graduate Alumni Survey which had an overall response rate 20-28 percent (statistically considered a very good response rate).

**II. Consent Calendar**

- Approval of the Agenda
- Approval of Meeting Minutes from October 2, 2013

**ACTION:** *The agenda and draft minutes with minor modifications.*

### III. Announcements from the President's Office, Academic Affairs

*Steve Beckwith, Vice President, Graduate Education*

*Pamela Jennings, Graduate Studies Director*

*Hilary Baxter, Interim Director Academic Planning, Programs and Coordination*

VP Steve Beckwith discussed topics of particular interest to CCGA including: the Council of Chancellors will take up the issue of graduate education at their meeting today; the presentation to Regents on graduate education next week; and the forthcoming President's initiative on graduation education.

Interim Director Hilary Baxter discussed the forthcoming call for campus five-year plans; the President's meetings with WASC president; ways in which standardized assessment template does not work for very well for UC and the need for metrics that are less rigid, less prescriptive, locally defined, discipline specific and faculty-driven.

### IV. Policies under Review

A. [APM - 600 series revisions](#) (comments due Nov. 25)

***ACTION:*** *CCGA agreed to send a brief letter that mentions its concern that there is no mention of graduate students in the APM as revised.*

B. [APM - 025 revisions](#) (comments due Feb. 15)

***ACTION:*** *John Bolander (UCD) was assigned to review and lead CCGA discussion at the December meeting.*

C. [APM - 670 revisions](#) (comments due Feb. 15)

***ACTION:*** *Youngho Seo (UCSF) was assigned to review and lead CCGA discussion at the January meeting.*

D. [APM - 671 new policy](#) (comments due Feb. 15)

***ACTION:*** *Shauna Somerville (UCB) was assigned to review and lead CCGA discussion at the December meeting.*

E. [APM - 035 revisions](#) (comments due Jan. 23)

***ACTION:*** *Maite Zubiarre (UCLA) was assigned to review and lead CCGA discussion at the December meeting.*

F. [SSGPDP policy revision](#) (comments due Feb. 7)

***ACTION:*** *Kwai Ng (UCSD) and Shauna (UCB) were assigned to review and lead CCGA discussion at the December meeting.*

G. [PDST policy revision](#) (comments due TBA)

***ACTION:*** *John Kim (UCR) was assigned to review and lead CCGA discussion at the December meeting.*

**V. Consultation with Academic Senate Leadership –**

*William Jacob, Academic Council Chair*

*Mary Gilly, Academic Council Vice Chair*

*Martha Winnacker, Executive Director, Academic Senate*

**DISCUSSION:** Chair William Jacob discussed Council's concerns with the development of the UC Care plan; concerns on composite benefit rates and support levels for graduate students; the upcoming joint Administration/Senate presentation to the Regents; the tensions between the two reports on graduate education and the inherent limitations of NRST; budgetary issues related to enrollment management; re-benching distribution formulas and the ways that graduate students are counted or funded should reflect actual student enrollment instead of targeted figures for (Doc 2A students are not counted/funded for example). Dean Andrew Szeri from the COGD noted that the "Doc x" terminology has been historically defined Systemwide but applied somewhat differently on individual campuses: Doc 1s (advanced to candidacy); Doc2s (less than three years advanced to candidacy); Doc2As (more than three years advanced to candidacy). Chair Jacob also mentioned having just received four pages of recommendations on graduate education sent from UCSA to President Napolitano.

**VI. Proposed Graduate Degrees and Programs for Review**

*All program proposals are posted on the CCGA SharePoint site (previewed at the first meeting); contact the [committee analyst](#) if you would like the proposal(s) e-mailed to you.*

**A. Proposal for a Program of Graduate Studies in the Interdisciplinary Humanities for the M.A. and Ph.D. Degrees at UC Merced – Lead Reviewer Bruce Schumm (UCSC)**

**DISCUSSION:** Prof. Schumm was not in attendance. In his stead, Chair Mastronarde summarized CCGA's previous concerns. The main issues that continued to cause concern are (1) the lack of a focus in the definition of interdisciplinarity and the judgment that the current proposal is a catchall compromise; (2) the need to define a strategic plan for future growth of the Arts and Humanities faculty (in the context of UCM's plan for growth overall) and how such a plan meshes with the proposal. Minor concerns are (1) the desire to see a better explanation of the distinction between the M.A. and the Ph.D. and (2) the desire to see more information about funding. Some of the members also remain concerned about the issue of access to foreign language instruction. After the vote it was agreed that Chair Mastronarde would draft a response and share it with the members before sending a final version back to the campus.

**ACTION:** *CCGA voted (9-0-1) to return the proposal to the campus for revision.*

**B. Proposal from the UCLA School of Nursing to issue a Terminal Master's Degree as part of the Ph.D. Program – Chair Mastronarde**

**ACTION:** *Following a brief discussion, CCGA voted (9-0-1) to approve the proposal without further review.*

**C. Proposal from UCI for a Ph.D. in Informatics – Lead Reviewer Valerie Leppert (UCM)**

**DISCUSSION:** Prof. Leppert summarized the comments from reviewers and campus responses. She recommended CCGA approval at this time with the advice that the M.S. policy exceptions be treated with more scrutiny (less routine).

**ACTION:** *CGGA voted (9-0-1) to approve the proposal.*

**VI. Proposed Graduate Degrees and Programs for Review** *(continued)*

**D. Proposal from UCM for a Ph.D. in Applied Mathematics – Lead Reviewer Youngho Seo (UCSF)**

DISCUSSION: Prof. Seo summarized the comments from reviewers and campus responses and recommended CCGA approval at this time.

ACTION: *CCGA voted (9-0-1) to approve the proposal.*

**E. Proposal for a New Graduate Program from UC San Diego at the Scripps Institution of Oceanography: Master of Advanced Studies (M.A.S.) Degree in Climate Science and Policy (CSP) – Co-Lead Reviewers Maite Zubiaurre (UCLA) and Shauna Somerville (UCB)**

DISCUSSION: Prof. Zubiarre and Prof. Somerville reported that after reviewing the proposal, felt that there wasn't anything to suggest a more thorough review was needed. Instead, they recommended that CCGA request response from the proposers to a set of very specific concerns. Chair Mastronarde asked if there were any other CCGA members that shared his concerns with the M.A.S. designation as a full-time program, rather than a Masters of Climate Science and Policy degree (the M.A.S. title is usually reserved for programs aimed toward part-time working professionals). He would like CCGA to collect at some point information from the campuses and deans on the issues at hand. CCGA felt it necessary to distinguish between the issues at hand: 1) the validity of, and applicability for the M.A.S./Masters of X title; 2) whether or not continue expedited review or to proceed with seeking at least two external reviews to help assess quality of the proposal.

ACTION: *Prof. Zubiarre and Prof. Shaunville will work on soliciting the two external reviews.*

**F. Proposal from UCR for Professional Master of Public Policy degree in the School of Public Policy – Chair Mastronarde**

ACTION: *Kwai Ng (UCSD) was assigned as lead reviewer.*

**G. Proposal from the UCLA Department of Economics to establish a Master of Arts in Applied Economics – Chair Mastronarde**

DISCUSSION: Chair Mastronarde also mentioned that he would like to pose the question of why not use the "Masters of X" degree designation to the campus before the proposal is sent to external reviewers for their review.

ACTION: *John Bolander (UCD) was assigned as lead reviewer.*

**VII. Proposed Name Change: UCSD M.A.S. in Health Law to M.A.S. in Health Policy and Law**

ACTION: *CCGA voted (9-0-1) to accept the simple name change without further review.*

### **VIII. New Business – Chair Mastronarde and Members**

- A. Performance Metrics:** CCGA discussed performance metrics relative to peer institutions: time-to-degree, intermediate steps in, selectivity, yield on offers of admissions, sustainability of funding/student's net stipend, attrition rates and timing of, distinction/ ranking/reputation, faculty to student ratio, indebtedness, sufficiency of space and resources for, deleterious impact of TA-ships on time-to-degree, diversity, student and faculty awards. See *2010 UCOP Accountability Sub Report on Graduate and Professional Education* for useful metrics that can be measured across the UC system.
- B. Doc2A:** Dean Szeri shared some data from the Berkeley campus; differentiation in how “normative time-to-degree+1” policy applied on the campuses.
- C. Themes for possible Sacramento meeting:** CCGA discussed what themes it should discuss that would be of particular interest to this audience.
- D. Draft letter on degree titles and clarifying current CCGA interpretation of relevant policies in place on degree designations:** Chair Mastronarde will circulate a revised draft for members to share with local GCs for comment.

### **IX. Discussion of Issues at Divisional Graduate Councils – Chair Mastronarde and Members**

*Berkeley:* Chair Mastronarde clarified his earlier comments on program learning outcomes.

*Merced:* There are four program proposals in process. Inquiry regarding treatment of concentrations, specialties, and designated emphases outside of graduate degree program. Distinction between administrative and Senate review of academic program reviews.

*San Diego:* Two new proposals forthcoming: Joint UCSD-San Diego State Ph.D. in Substance Use and one other.

### **X. Consultation with Provost Aimée Dorr – Chair Mastronarde and Members**

**DISCUSSION:** Provost Dorr reported that revised SSGPDP policy is ready for Senatewide review and will be sent very shortly. She commented on the issues at the center of the Anderson School conversion controversy and President's Yudof's eventual action on the matter, which in her estimation, was a one-off decision and not an indicator of future decision-making practice. She shared her views on the validity of the diminution of faculty engagement in graduate education as a basis for CCGA not to approve a program proposal and noted that historically, the APC has in fact viewed this as an appropriate consideration in assessing the academic merits of a program and for making a decision about whether or not to approve a particular program proposal. The revised SSGPDP policy includes new language related to the issues associated with conversions. As its originating-author and a past-chair of CCGA and APC, she recalled how *the Compendium* was initially intended to create efficiencies in the review of program proposals and to clarify how current policies should be applied rather than to create new policy. She also noted that the same APC-cohort of individuals that worked on the policy revision this past year will reconvene to look at it one last time following the Systemwide review. CCGA asked how it should treat SSGPDP program proposals in the interim. Provost Dorr suggested that a reading of the revised draft policy by would be helpful to CCGA in making a determination as it is unlikely that major changes with regard to SDGPDPs following the Systemwide review. The Provost also discussed the topic of indirect cost

**X. Consultation with Provost Aimée Dorr (*continued*)**

recovery calculation and on how to calculate the marginal cost to educate a student. Her closing remarks focused on the importance of engaging the faculty in the discussion of goals for any measures or metrics proposed.

**Adjournment:**

The meeting was adjourned at 4:15 p.m.

Attest: Donald Mastronarde, Chair  
Prepared: Eric Zárate, Principal Committee Analyst

**CCGA 2013-14 Remaining Meeting Schedule:**

December 4, 2013 – 10325 Franklin  
January 8, 2014 – 5320 Franklin  
February 5, 2014 – 11326 Franklin  
March 5, 2014 – 11326 Franklin  
April 9, 2014 – 5320 Franklin  
May 7, 2014 – 11326 Franklin  
June 4, 2014 – 11326 Franklin