

COORDINATING COMMITTEE ON GRADUATE AFFAIRS

Minutes of Meeting

Wednesday, October 2, 2013

10:00 a.m. – 4:00 p.m.

UCOP Main Building, 1111 Franklin Street, Oakland – Room 10325

Audio Primary Dial-In: 1-866-740-1260 | Passcode: 9879466

<http://www.universityofcalifornia.edu/senate/>**I. Welcome; Introduction of Members and Guests – Chair Donald Mastronarde**

- **September 25 Meeting with the Provost/Academic Council Meeting:** Among the issues discussed, ongoing budget negotiations with the legislature and the governor; Governor is wedded to not raising tuition; UC's stance is that long-range budget model of steady minor tuition increases better than occasional large tuition increases; increases fall short of meeting UC's fixed costs; Funding Stream refinements to go into effect next year but President has yet to weigh-in; Open Enrollment changes; Innovative Learning Technology Initiative (ILTI) will concentrate on large undergraduate courses; some system of campus enrollment planning in place by end of the year; arrival of new UC president.
- **October 8 Council of Graduate Deans:** Vice Chair Jutta Heckhausen will represent CCGA this year on the Council. Valerie Leppert (UCM) volunteered to fill-in for Jutta at the next COGD phone meeting on October 8, from 3 to 4 p.m.

II. Consent Calendar

- Approval of the Agenda (addition of other proposals under IV.B.)
- Approval of Record of Summer Vote from August 19, 2013
- Approval of Meeting Minutes from December 5, 2012

ACTION: *The agenda and summer vote record were approved with minor corrections; the minutes were approved as noticed.*

III. Overview of Committee Charge, Processes, Member Roles and Responsibilities, and Resources; Brief Introduction to SharePoint – Chair Mastronarde and Members

Chair Mastronarde provided an overview of CCGA's charge and program review processes, the [Compendium](#), [CCGA Handbook](#), and with committee members, discussed individual roles, responsibilities, along with other resources, including [SharePoint](#) site. Hilary noted that the old CPEC Questionnaire form is no longer required (the change will be reflected in the next update of the Compendium). In the meantime, Hilary agreed to inform the relevant staff at campuses so that proposers starting to work now will be spared this work.

IV. **Announcements from the President's Office, Academic Affairs**

Steven Beckwith, Vice President, Office for Research and Graduate Studies

Pamela Jennings, Graduate Studies Director

Hilary Baxter, Interim Director Academic Planning, Programs and Coordination

Vice President Steven Beckwith introduced Director Pamela Jennings and the discussed some of the work that they do in Research and Graduate Studies, including a major initiative to survey graduate students to see where they ultimately end up after graduation along with outreach to private industry and the campuses on the value and impact of UC graduate education. To that end, they are working with the Bay Area Science and Innovation Council on a forum for private industry and UC graduate students underwritten by IBM. He discussed the requisite workplace skills including communication skills, critical thinking skills, ability to process large bits of information and work collaboratively, and the need to rethink graduate education in a way that prepares graduate students for work outside academia. Other thoughts discussed including time-to-degree, and demand abroad for graduates conversant in foreign languages.

Director Pamela Jennings provided an update on several other initiatives including: the UC-HBCU Initiative (a faculty grants program to further the pipeline to of HBCU students to UC graduate programs) with historically Black colleges and universities); outreach to legislators in Sacramento; UC graduate alumni survey modeled on successful Berkeley survey; and ongoing work with UCAAD on a proposal to establish a parallel program aimed at institutions historically serving Hispanic students nationwide. She also shared a few sample ORGS publications. Academic Council Chair Bill Jacob noted the apparent interest of the new UC Student Regent on building the pipeline of underrepresented minority students to UC graduate programs. He suggested that ORGS may want to provide the Student Regent-designee with an inventory of existing programs in place Systemwide.

Interim Director Hilary Baxter described for the benefit of new members: the parallel Systemwide review of new program proposals, APC revisions to policies relating to SSGDPs and PDSTs, the *Compendium*, including references to CPEC, changes to campus five-year planning perspectives (last collected by UCOP three years ago); a couple of proposals forthcoming that would normally be subject to review by the joint UC-CSU Graduate Board but it's been proposed that UC/CSU forego such review if both parties in agreement; continued WASC interest in graduate student completion rates and ways of looking at learning outcomes; growing legislative interest in updating the historic degree granting functions for UC, CSU, and the CCC segments (i.e., differentiation of) as delineated in the California Master Plan for Higher Education; the last Master Plan review gave rise to call for metrics mostly focused for undergraduate education; future effect on graduate education undermined at this time; WASC rubrics and performance metrics for quality assurance and accountability for graduate education and planning for forthcoming introductory meeting between the WASC President and President Napolitano.

V. Consultation with the Academic Senate Leadership –

William Jacob, Academic Council Chair

Mary Gilly, Academic Council Vice Chair

Martha Winnacker, Academic Senate Executive Director

Todd Giedt, Academic Senate Associate Director

Senate leaders provided an overview of the policies, procedures, protocols, 2013-14 Senate priorities, and other generally helpful information for new committee members.

Director Martha Winnacker noted important updates to the senate travel information, including: that receipts are no longer required reimbursement of incidentals less than \$75; preference for members to submit form electronically; the new address for where to send completed forms. Members were encouraged to contact Martha or Eric as a first-step to resolving any travel-related matters.

Associate Director Todd Giedt briefly discussed SharePoint and his ongoing work on legislative matters on behalf of the Senate in relation to graduate education.

Academic Council Bill Jacob discussed several large looming issues including: the transition to the new UC president; Open Enrollment changes this year; the planned presentation on graduate education at the November Regents meetings; SB 195 (Liu) which was recently signed by the governor mandating the collection of data related to state funding for higher education (with no mention of who is to collect data or exactly what data to collect); the topic of metrics related to the bill and the need for the Senate to help the Provost discern and articulate metrics particularly germane to graduate education; ongoing efforts to provide the governor with current and accurate information with regard the budget, faculty salaries and faculty re-numeration; the UC-wide faculty salary equity study and campus-specific equity studies in the process of being revised by the campuses; last year's joint UCORP and BOARS outreach to Sacramento (Chair Jacob suggested CCGA may want to participate this coming year, i.e., hold special CCGA February 2014 meeting in Sacramento); impact of changes to composite benefit rates for graduate studies; re-benching; undergraduate enrollment discussions; the Innovative Learning Technology Initiative; and UC Online Education Initiative.

VI. Proposed Graduate Degrees and Programs for Review

All program proposals are posted on the CCGA SharePoint site (previewed at the first meeting); contact the [committee analyst](#) if you would like the proposal(s) e-mailed to you.

A. Proposal for a Graduate Program from UC San Diego at the Scripps Institution of Oceanography: Master of Advanced Studies (M.A.S.) Degree in Climate Science and Policy (CSP) – Chair Mastronarde

DISCUSSION: Chair Mastronarde discussed several concerns about the proposal. He asked for a volunteers to review for next meeting on the need for additional campus review and the appropriateness of degree designation as M.A.S. and any related issues that requiring review by external expert for example,

ACTION: *Maite Zubiarre (UCLA) and Shauna Somerville (UCB) were assigned as Co-Lead Reviewers.*

B. Proposal for a Graduate Program leading to the Ph.D. in Informatics at UC Irvine – Lead Reviewer Valerie Leppert (UCM)

Prof. Leppert shared highlights from the proposal for this proposed stand-alone program. She reported that she didn't see any major complications, though expressed a couple of concerns related to the treatment of students in the new program and the difference between the degree requirements of the new and old programs and resultant impact on students. CCGA members concurred on the need for, based on how they respond to CCGA's concerns, supplemental review by an outside external expert.

C. Proposal for a Graduate Program leading to the Ph.D. in Applied Mathematics at UC Merced – Lead Reviewer Youngho Seo (UCSF)

Prof. Seo reported that he has collected five internal and external reviews and uploaded these to SharePoint. He summarized overlapping comments from the reviewers for three-part focus (i.e., not solely on Applied Mathematics alone); observation of lack of corresponding "pure" mathematics program at Merced and questions about program offerings. He noted that his major questions have been answered have been internally and wondered if he should pose the same questions to the external reviewers. [I don't recall this; please check the recording.] Members agreed that Prof. Seo should now present the summarized comments to the proposers to seek their reaction.

VIII. Items presented in the Summer 2013

A. Proposal for a Program of Graduate Studies in the Interdisciplinary Humanities for the M.A. and Ph.D. Degrees at UC Merced – Lead Reviewer Bruce Schumm (UCSC)

Chair Mastronarde shared comments from Prof. Schumm, who was not in attendance, along with comments received from one other individual. One member expressed that on the surface; the proposal seems overly vague and raises questions about its future ability to flourish over the long-haul as a Ph.D. program and on the placement and job prospects of graduates.

ACTION: Members were asked to briefly write up their concerns in the form of constructive suggestions to send these to him so that he can pass these along to Prof. Schumm.

B. Proposal from the UCLA School of Nursing to Issue a Terminal Master's Degree as part of the Ph.D. Program – Chair Mastronarde

Chair Mastronarde stated that though there is a provision in *the Compendium* for the issuance of this type of degree, there was at least one member who would like to see the proposal reviewed by at least one outside reviewer. Ruth Mulnard will be asked if she would advise CCGA on this proposal.

C. Proposal to Disestablish the Graduate Group and Joint Doctoral Program in Jewish Studies at UC Berkeley – Chair Mastronarde

Chair Mastronarde retraced how the campus arrived at its recommendation to discontinue the current program; have in place a plan to deal with current enrolled students, and encourage continued faculty scholarship in this area.

ACTION: CCGA members were satisfied that the local review bodies have been sufficiently consulted and voted (10-0-1) to accept the campus proposal.

**IX. Discussion of Issues at the Divisional Graduate Councils –
Chair Mastronarde and Members**

CCGA members were asked to highlight and discuss important issues coming from their respective Graduate Councils this year.

UCLA: *Undertaking review of certificate programs on that campus; efforts to identify general trends in graduate student diversity, mentorship programs*

UC San Diego: *Looking at issues related to conversion of in-residence programs to on-line programs.*

UC Irvine: *Looking at issues related to graduate student funding, issues related to competitiveness of campus financial aid offers, mentorship and support of graduate students, block allocations, promote faculty interest in revitalizing their respective programs.*

UC San Francisco: *Looking at issues related to the viability and student support of Graduate Program in History of Health Sciences brought to light during the current campus Program Review underway. Questions emerging around conversion of Global Health Sciences Graduate Program to a self-supporting stand-alone school. Chair Mastronarde referenced the section on the establishment of new schools in the Compendium, particularly new language on “pre-proposals” contained therein. Additional questions related to post-docs falling under the auspices of the local Graduate Division.*

UC Riverside: *Questions related to forthcoming proposal for School of Public Health proposal, the likelihood of expedited review in order to accommodate admitting students in the fall of 2015, need to identify core faculty that have been assigned to the proposed school.*

UC Santa Barbara: *Campus is in the midst of WASC accreditation. Discussing resource issues related to re-benching and the cannibalization of new programs on older ones (i.e., no new money).*

UC Davis: *Local Graduate Council not yet met.*

UC Merced: *There are six program proposals (all state-supported academic programs) in the works for submission to CCGA. In addition to reviewing the aforementioned half-dozen program programs, Graduate Council formalized as separate from research.*

UC Berkeley: *Looking at best practices and review processes for online program proposals; related issues for GSIs, mental-health issues for graduate students.*

X. New Business: Issues to consider this year – Chair Mastronarde and Members

- SSGDP policy revisions by APC out for Senate-wide review this month
- PDST policy revisions by APC and impending Senate-wide review this fall; couple of exceptions approved by the Regents
- Future implications of President Yudof's action to unilaterally approve the UCLA Anderson Graduate School of Management proposal over the objections from the Academic Council and contrary to CCGA's review.
- "Doc 2a" policy and related issues and as a starting place, the need to determine how the policy is applied on the campuses across the UC system; is the policy flexible enough; and collecting information on structural problems and bringing this issue to the attention of local graduate councils.
- Issue of "open source" and concerns about the "lag" contained in policy
- UCSD Graduate Growth and Excellence Initiative and similar programs on other campuses (Pamela to send more info)
- Auxiliary funding on the campuses to support needs of graduate international, URM, women, on a level for comparable for undergraduate students
- NRT, need to pay attention to whether anything can be done in response to report
- What has happened to online programs approved in the last couple of years?
- CCGA consultation with ILTI and UCOE (invite Chairs to future CCGA meeting)
- Issue of graduate students having to pay higher fees to enroll in Summer Session courses than is charged to undergraduates enrolled in the same lower division undergraduate Summer Session course, such as introductory foreign language courses. Staff members were asked to look into whether or not the practice is an amalgam at a single campus or if it is more widespread and thereby supported by Systemwide policy unknown to CCGA.

Adjournment:

The meeting was adjourned at 3:31 p.m.

Attest to: Donald Mastronarde, CCGA Chair
Prepared by: Eric Zárate, Principal Committee Analyst

CCGA 2013-14 Remaining Meeting Schedule:

November 6, 2013 – 10325 Franklin
December 4, 2013 – 10325 Franklin
January 8, 2014 – 5320 Franklin
February 5, 2014 – 11326 Franklin
March 5, 2014 – 11326 Franklin
April 9, 2014 – 5320 Franklin
May 7, 2014 – 11326 Franklin
June 4, 2014 – 11326 Franklin