

## COORDINATING COMMITTEE ON GRADUATE AFFAIRS

**Minutes of Meeting****Tuesday, May 1, 2012****10:00 a.m. – 4:00 p.m.****UCOP, 1111 Franklin Street, Oakland – Room 11326****Telephone: 510-987-9466**<http://www.universityofcalifornia.edu/senate/>**I. Call to Order/Consent Calendar – Chair Rachael Goodhue**

- Approval of the Agenda
- Approval of the December 6, 2011, January 3, March 3, and April 1, 2012 Meeting Minutes

**ACTION:** The agenda was approved as modified. The revised minutes from March 3 were approved with a minor correction.

**II. Chair's Report/Announcements/Updates – Chair Rachael Goodhue**

- April 11 Academic Assembly Meeting: Appointment of Council Vice Chair for 2012-13.
- April 20 Joint Senate/UCOP Leadership Conference Call
- April 25 Academic Council Meeting: Passage of the Memorial to the Regents; UCSF Senate Membership Proposal; convening of new Senate Membership TF; [Assembly Bill 2190](#); UC online education; the Salary Equity analysis.
- Other: Chair Goodhue will be out of town on June 5; Vice Chair Sharon Farmer to chair the June meeting; the July meeting, if needed, will held via iLinc.

**III. Announcements from the President's Office, Academic Affairs –**

*Pamela Jennings, Director of Graduate Studies, ORGS*

*Hilary Baxter, Assistant Director, Academic Planning, Programs and Coordination*

Hilary Baxter discussed the Anderson School proposal and OGC opinion; the provost would like to reconvene Academic Planning Council to revisit how to handle conversions from state-supported to self-supported status and CCGA's promulgated disestablishment guidelines and to resolve the procedural impasse between the Administration and the Senate on this issue.

**IV. Self-Supporting Programs****A. SSP Subcommittee Report – Bruce Schumm (UCSC), Andrew Chisholm (UCSD), Mike Vanderwood (UCR)**

Prof. Schumm reported that they hope to have a draft report ready for the next meeting; Vice Chair Sharon Farmer suggested that it would be ideal to discuss the draft guidelines as part of the revised CCGA Handbook, if possible, at the next meeting.

**B. UCLA Proposal from the Department of Architecture and Urban Design to Convert the M.Arch II Program to Self-Supporting Status – Chair Goodhue, Karen Gyls (UCLA), Lead Reviewer Ruth Mulnard (UCI)**

Prof. Mulnard noted that the proposal appears to be very well done and that she hopes to have her review ready for the next meeting. Chair Goodhue suggested borrowing UCLA model language for CCGA Handbook.

**V. Executive Session** (members only please)

**CAGSS Task Force and Joint Administrative-Senate Workgroup on Graduate Education**  
– *Chair Goodhue*

Note: Minutes were not recorded for this Executive Session portion of the meeting.

**VI. Proposed Graduate Degrees and Programs for Review**

*All program proposals are now posted on the CCGA SharePoint site; contact the [committee analyst](#) if you would like the proposal(s) e-mailed to you.*

**A. UCLA Proposal from the Department of Architecture and Urban Design to Convert the M.Arch II Program to Self-Supporting Status** – *Chair Goodhue, Karen Gyls (UCLA), Lead Reviewer Ruth Mulnard (UCI)*

REPORT: See above.

**B. Proposal to add a Master of Translational Medicine at UC Berkeley** – *Lead Reviewer Andrew Chisholm (UCSD)*

REPORT: Prof. Chisholm reported that he has two internal reviewers confirmed; still looking for external reviewers. It was suggested that he might comb through the NIH [National Center for Advancing Translational Sciences](#) (NCATS) site.

**C. Proposal for a M.S./Ph.D. Program in Chemistry and Chemical Biology at UC Merced** – *Lead Reviewer Alan Buckpitt (UCD)*

REPORT: Prof. Buckpitt that reported that he has one review in hand; one coming; and is looking for one more with some difficulty.

**D. Proposal for a Part-time, Self-supporting Master of Engineering (M.Eng.) Program at UC Berkeley** – *Lead Reviewer Bruce Schumm (UCSC)*

REPORT: Prof. Schumm summarized his findings and questions raised thus far in the review. He is waiting for campus response and will forward his report to be circulated for review and a possible vote.

**E. Proposal for a Master in Bioengineering (M.Eng.) Program at UC Berkeley** – *Lead Reviewer Mike Vanderwood (UCR)*

REPORT: Prof. Vanderwood reported that he has a couple of reviews in hand and hopes to have his report ready for next meeting

**F. Proposal for a Graduate Program in Computational Biology leading to the M.S. and Ph.D. Degrees at UC Berkeley** – *Lead Reviewer Andrew Chisholm (UCSD)*

REPORT: Prof. Chisholm two external reviews in hand and one on its way.

**G. Proposal for a Graduate Program leading to the M.S. and Ph.D. Degrees in Energy at UC Davis – Lead Reviewer Dan Arovas (UCSD)**

**REPORT:** Prof Arovas briefed members on the review to date and summarized outstanding issues and the challenges presented by the overall non-responsiveness of the proponents to date. CCGA felt that the proposal as submitted was incomplete and rejected the proposal on these grounds with the option of resubmitting the proposal to CCGA.

**Proposed Graduate Degrees and Programs for Review** (*continued*)

**ACTION:** CCGA voted (9-0-2) to reject the proposal in its current form and to inform the proposers that they may submit a new proposal to CCGA for consideration. When submitting the new proposal, the proposers will have the option of starting anew with a “blank slate” and/or providing *in addition* proposal materials from this round of review. In either case, the new proposal should be accompanied by a letter documenting how the proposers have responded to issues, concerns, and gaps in information identified by CCGA, as well as make clear how the new proposal differs from the rejected one. The new proposal must stand on its own merits and be submitted in a complete format in conformance with the guidelines described in the Compendium (Appendix C).

**VII. Consultation with the Academic Senate Leadership –**

*Robert Anderson, Academic Council Chair*

Chair Bob Anderson reported that UCR&J will consider the UCSF proposal on Senate membership proposal next week; UC is still trying to negotiate a multi-year budget agreement with the Legislature; he noted varying scenarios if the state ballot measure fails.

**New Item Update on GSR Unionization – Peter Chester, Associate Director, Labor Relations**

Peter Chester presented an update on GSR unionization, state Senate Bill 259.

**VIII. Discussion of Issues at the Divisional Graduate Councils and Updates/Inquiries from the Divisional Senates – Chair Goodhue and Members**

**A. Los Angeles: Anderson School Proposal – Chair Goodhue and Karen Gyls (UCLA)**

DISCUSSION: Chair Goodhue reported on communications with the UCLA Graduate Council regarding their assessment of the review. Senate Chair Robert Anderson commented on communications with the Administration regarding possible sticking point that the earlier GC/Executive Committee decisions may be tainted based on their reliance on the unapproved CCGA guidelines on how to treat conversions to self-supporting program status, that some mistakenly believe to be founded on financial grounds rather than academic ones. CCGA will revisit the topic next in June.

**B. Davis: Program Review Committee (PRC) Report on the Soils and Biochemistry Group (SBGG) – Chair Goodhue and Andrew Buckpitt (UCD)**

DISCUSSION: After a brief discussion, it was agreed that Chair Goodhue will draft a letter to Council stating CCGA's concerns and circulate it for comment; she will also convey concerns to Davis Graduate Council.

**C. Santa Barbara: Proposed Name Change for the Master of Arts and Doctor of Philosophy in “Art History” to the Master of Arts and Doctor of Philosophy in “History of Art and Architecture” – Rita Raley (UCSB)**

ACTION: After a brief discussion, CCGA voted (8-0-3) to accept the proposal for a simple name change.

**D. San Francisco: Academic Senate Membership – Robert Raffai (UCSF)**

*The San Francisco Division has stated that it intends to issue an interpretation of the Standing Orders of the Regents [SOR 105.1(a)] to extend Senate membership to new titles in professional schools.*

DISCUSSION: Prof. Raffai reported on the UCSF proposal; CCGA members offered a few comments to bring back to the campus.

**E. Berkeley: Chancellor Birgeneau's Governance Paper – Donald Mastronarde (UCB)**

DISCUSSION: Prof. Mastronarde reported on Chancellor Birgeneau's paper entitled, [\*Modernizing Governance at the University of California: A Proposal that the Regents Create and Delegate Some Responsibilities to Campus Boards\*](#). He discussed possible implications for UC graduate education and solicited comments from CCGA members.

**F. San Diego: Dissertation Committee Membership – Athina Markou (UCSD Alternate)**

DISCUSSION: Prof. Markou reported that the San Diego campus is discussing dissertation committee membership and asked other CCGA members what is the norm on other campuses with respect to the size of the dissertation committee and the number of members outside the candidate's area of expertise. In general, members responded that the composition of dissertation committees vary by department and range in size from a minimum of 3 to 5 members with at least one member from outside the department.

**IX. UC San Francisco Proposal to Retroactively Change the Doctor of Nursing Science (DNS) Degree to a Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D.) Degree – Chair Goodhue and Robert Raffai (UCSF)**

DISCUSSION: Prof. Raffai briefed CCGA members on the proposal.

ACTION: CCGA voted (11-0-1) to endorse the Divisional decision.

**X. UC Irvine Proposal to Reconstitute the Department of Education as a School of Education – Lead Reviewer Sharon Farmer (UCSB)**

REPORT: Prof. Farmer briefed CCGA on the proposal and reported that she has reviews forthcoming from four reviewers and hopes to have her report ready by next month. She also shared several questions for UCEP and UCPB feedback.

**Adjournment:**

The meeting was adjourned at 2:30 p.m.

Attest: Rachael Goodhue, CCGA Chair  
Prepared by Eric Zárate, Committee Analyst

**CCGA 2011-12 Remaining Meeting Schedule:**

June 5, 2012 – 11326

July 3, 2012 – 11326