#### COORDINATING COMMITTEE ON GRADUATE AFFAIRS

Minutes of iLinc Video Conference Tuesday, January 3, 2012 1:00 p.m. – 4:30 p.m. Primary Dial-In: 1-866-740-1260 | Passcode: 9879466

http://www.universityofcalifornia.edu/senate/

### I. Chair's Report/Announcements/Updates – Chair Rachael Goodhue

- December 14 Academic Council Meeting: Council unanimously endorsed UCEP's proposal
  and white paper and CCGA's memo requesting permanent exemption from external
  benchmarking measures and approved forwarding them to the WASC president; Council
  authorized Chair Anderson to draft a letter rejecting APM 668 as written, outlining the
  significant concerns that would have to be addressed in any similar proposal in the future;
  Council also briefly discussed issues associated with rebenching.
- December 15 Council Task Force on Competitiveness in Academic Graduate Student Support (CAGSS): CAGSS met twice in December and worked on drafting the task force's three basic themes: non-competitive financial offers; institutional accounting methods; and high levels of non-resident tuition (NRT) for Ph.D. students. The task force expects to issue their final report in June.
- December 21 Council of Graduate Deans Meeting: CCGA's representative Ruth Mulnard (UCI) noted that the meeting was cancelled. Tyrus Miller from COGD announced that upcoming UC Graduate Advocacy Day in Sacramento on May 14.

### II. Consent Calendar

- Approval of the Agenda
- Approval of the November 1 and December 6, 2011 Meeting Minutes

<u>ACTION</u>: The agenda was approved as noticed. Approval of the minutes was postponed until next meeting.

### III. Announcements from the President's Office, Academic Affairs

Hilary Baxter, Assistant Director, Academic Planning, Programs and Coordination

Hilary Baxter noted that she had no comments apart from possible comments on the UCLA Anderson School Proposal and the UCSD Affiliation Agreement Proposal with CWSL.

### IV. Consultation with the Academic Senate Leadership –

Robert Anderson, Academic Council Chair

Chair Bob Anderson commented that he thought CCGA ought to do what it thinks is necessary in order to thoughtfully deliberate and make well-reasoned decisions on the two requests for expedited reviews and is very interested in hearing the discussion of these proposals.

# V. Request for Expedited Review: Proposed Affiliation Agreement between UCSD and California Western School of Law – Chair Goodhue

<u>DISCUSSION</u>: After a discussion of substantive concerns and development of a realistic timeline for doing an expedited, concurrent review, CCGA voted to take a wait-and-see approach on the outcome of the local review process (i.e., to see if the proposal moves forward) and request additional contextual background information in the meantime.

## VI. Discussion of Issues at the Divisional Graduate Councils and Inquiries from the Divisional Senates – Chair Goodhue and Members

**A.** UCLA Anderson School Proposal – Chair Goodhue, Karen Gylys (UCLA)

<u>DISCUSSION</u>: Chair Goodhue and Prof. Gylys reported on communications with the divisional Graduate Council on the proposal. CCGA discussed examples of how SSPs at other UC campuses have been structured, i.e., taxed, so that they have some financial benefit to the campus as a whole but acknowledged difficulty in quantifying the benefit in dollars. Members thought that the revenue sharing concept might make the privatization of state-supported programs more palatable. Chair Goodhue reported that the CCGA comments were sent to the divisional Senate Chair and to UCPB.

**B.** UCSF Inquiry: Joint class attendance of students enrolled in a self-supporting program in non-SSP courses offered on the same campus (Is it appropriate for student on campus to sit in the same classroom but pay different fees?) – *Chair Goodhue* 

<u>DISCUSSION</u>: At this point in time, CCGA has not developed any policies or guidelines regarding the enrollment of students in SSPs and state-supported programs in the same course. It is quite possible that CCGA will issue guidelines prior to the end of the academic year. The committee is engaged in an ongoing discussion regarding SSPs and their implications for graduate education at UC. At present, UCOP's SSP policy states (in VI.H.) that students may enroll in the same courses "so long as there is separate accounting for the self-supporting and state-supplied costs." CCGA considered the use M.O.U.s to help with accounting of resources and whether or not to develop implementation guidelines for the campuses.

C. UCSF Inquiry: Conversion of D.N.Sc. to Ph.D. – Chair Goodhue, Robert Raffai (UCSF), Lead Reviewer Ruth Mulnard (UCI)

<u>DISCUSSION</u>: Chair Goodhue reported that since the last meeting, we received a memo sent by the campus in response to questions and concerns previously raised by CCGA. Both she and Prof. Mulnard have reviewed the memo along with other documentation and are for the most part satisfied with the campus response. At this time, CCGA has not received an official request from the campus on which to take further action. Prof. Mulnard expressed the need to see documentation for the creation of the original D.N.Sc. proposal from 1984 in order for CCGA to make a determination on the equivalency of the degrees.

**ACTION:** Chair Goodhue will follow-up with the campus accordingly.

D. UC Davis Response to CCGA Memo: Status of the Applied Science Engineering Graduate Program – Chair Goodhue, Alan Buckpitt (UCD)

<u>ACTION</u>: After a brief discussion, CCGA determined that it is satisfied with the response and has no additional concerns.

E. UC San Diego Proposal for a Terminal Master of Science Degree in Oceanography, Marine Biology or Earth Sciences at the Scripps Institution of Oceanography

<u>DISCUSSION</u>: Chair Goodhue briefed CCGA on the UCSD proposal to add a terminal Master's degree with no changes to the curriculum or need for additional resources.

ACTION: CCGA voted unanimously with one abstention to approve the proposal.

### VII. Proposed Graduate Degrees and Programs for Review

All program proposals are now posted on the CCGA SharePoint site; contact the <u>committee</u> <u>analyst</u> if you would like the proposal(s) e-mailed to you.

A. Proposal for a Graduate Program in Feminist Studies leading to the Ph.D. Degree at UC Santa Cruz – Lead Reviewer Alan Buckpitt (UCD)

<u>REPORT</u>: Prof. Buckpitt reported that he has confirmed two reviewers and is waiting to hear back from another two external reviewers.

B. Proposal for a Graduate Program in Computational Biology leading to the M.S. and Ph.D. Degrees at UC Berkeley – Lead Reviewer Andrew Chisholm (UCSD)

<u>REPORT</u>: Prof. Chisholm provided a brief overview of the proposal based on his preliminary reading. He reported that he has one reviewer confirmed and is working on finding additional reviewers.

C. Proposal for a Graduate Program leading to the M.S. Degree in Computer Engineering at UC Riverside – Lead Reviewer Bruce Schumm (UCSC)

REPORT: Prof. Schumm was not in attendance.

D. Proposal for a Graduate Program leading to the Online M.S. Degree in Engineering at UC Riverside – Lead Reviewer Robert Raffai (UCSF)

<u>REPORT</u>: Prof. Raffai reported that he has received three external reviews and discussed concerns that have emerged this far in the review and the campus response to these critiques. He is waiting for one other review to come in.

E. Proposal for a Graduate Program leading to the M.A. Degree in Accounting, Auditing and Assurance at UC Riverside – Lead Reviewer Will Shadish (UCM)

<u>REPORT</u>: Prof. Shadish reported that he has received four reviews and has followed-up with the proposers on the questions raised by the reviewers thus far. He will take questions from CCGA back to the campus about the group capstone project and request more details.

F. Proposal for a Graduate Program leading to the M.A. Degree in Theater Arts at UC **Santa Cruz** – *Lead Reviewer Rita Raley (UCSB)* 

REPORT: Prof. Raley was not in attendance.

G. Proposal for a Graduate Program leading to the Ph.D. Degree in Latin American and **Latino Studies at UC Santa Cruz** – *Lead Reviewer Sharon Farmer (UCSB)* 

REPORT: Prof. Farmer reported that she had received one review and waiting for two others to arrive.

H. Proposal for a Graduate Program leading to the M.S. Degree in Biotechnology **Management at UC Irvine** – *Interim Lead Reviewer Rachael Goodhue (UCD)* 

REPORT: Chair Goodhue reported that there was nothing new to report since the last meeting.

I. Proposal for a Graduate Program leading to the M.S. and Ph.D. Degrees in Energy at **UC Davis** – Lead Reviewer Dan Arovas (UCSD)

REPORT: There was nothing new to report since the last meeting.

J. Proposal for a Graduate Program in Nursing Science leading to the Ph.D. Degree at **UC Irvine** – *Lead Reviewer Donald Mastronarde (UCB)* 

REPORT: Prof. Mastronarde reported that he waiting for three reviews to come in.

- VIII. UC Davis Request to Discontinue the Exercise Science M.S. Program Chair Goodhue ACTION: After a brief discussion, CCGA determined that it has no additional concerns.
- IX. UCLA Request to Disestablish the BME IDP and Transfer the Degree Programs to **Bioengineering** – Chair Goodhue

ACTION: After a brief discussion, CCGA determined that it has no additional concerns.

#### X. **New Business**

There was no new business.

### **CCGA 2011-12 Remaining Meeting Schedule:**

February 7, 2012 – 5320 March 6, 2012 – 11326

April 3, 2012 – iLinc

May 1, 2012 – 11326

June 5, 2012 – 11326

July 3, 2012 – 11326